

# Job Satisfaction of Vocational High School Teachers

**Bunyamin**

University of Muhammadiyah Prof. DR. HAMKA, Indonesia

Email: bunyamin@uhamka.ac.id

## KEYWORDS

Teacher Satisfaction,  
Vocational School, Teacher  
Commitment

## ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to analyze the relationship between: 1) organizational climate with teacher job satisfaction, 2) commitment with teacher job satisfaction and 3) climate and commitment together with teacher job satisfaction. The research was conducted at SMK in Ciracas District, East Jakarta with a population of 362 teachers. Using the Slovin formula with an error rate of 0.05, a simple random sample of 191 teachers was taken. Test the hypothesis using a correlation test. For the measurement of job satisfaction variables, five dimensions are used: namely interest in work done with indicators (1) diligent work and (2) increasing competence. The dimensions of awards received with indicators (1) compensation and (2) promotion. The supervisor's ability dimension provides technical assistance with indicators: (1) academic supervision and (2) clinical supervision. In general, the results of the study prove that the job satisfaction of teachers working at SMK Ciracas District can be influenced by organizational climate variables and commitment variables. As for suggestions for research related to the integration model of the influence of organizational climate variables and organizational commitment to job satisfaction, it can be done in the scope of work of private organizations.

## INTRODUCTION

The rapid development of the world causes the acceleration of all aspects, causing positive and negative impacts. The positive effect at this time is the possibility to participate with foreign countries. The negative effects are felt even when they are not able to compete with foreign countries, because in this situation SMK graduates are considered weak. The reason for the lack of personnel in Indonesia is the lack of specialist knowledge and professional skills of individuals. Strengthening work is carried out through improvement, especially at the professional education level, which allows the creation of competent and quality graduate productivity, in accordance with the objectives of SMK to produce superior human resources. (Sari et al., 2022).

SMK is a formal education unit that organizes secondary vocational education and specifically prepares students to work in certain fields. As one of the educational organizations in which it consists of various components. One of them is the human resources component. Human resources in schools are educators or teachers. Teachers who provide lessons to students are required to provide their competencies. Teachers have feelings, thoughts and desires that can influence attitudes to conduct lessons Gorton (1976) found deep satisfaction that Teaching context refers to the degree of fulfillment of one's personal needs and professionalism in the role of teacher. The following one of the things that need to be considered is teacher job satisfaction (Mukhlison, 2008).

Of course, the satisfaction of a teacher in an organization, educational institution, agency or company is relative, because satisfaction is individual so that teacher satisfaction with one teacher varies from one another. For some people, differences in a teacher's experience, background, social environment and interest in his job also affect his work. Job satisfaction is a positive feeling that comes from evaluating job characteristics. This definition certainly has a very broad meaning. According to (Colquitt et al., 2020) "Job satisfaction is a pleasant statement that

results from appreciating someone's job and what you like about your job". Job satisfaction is a pleasant statement that results from appreciating one's job and what one likes about one's job.

According to Mathis, R.L. and Jackson (2019), in the most basic sense, job satisfaction is a positive emotional state resulting from the evaluation of work experience. Kreitner & Kinicki (2014) job satisfaction is a response that affects various aspects of work or emotional response. According to Luthans (2015), job satisfaction is the result of teachers' perceptions of how well their work conveys important issues. According to Robbins & Judge (2015), job satisfaction is a general attitude toward a person's job that shows the difference between the amount of compensation employees receive and the amount they believe they will receive. According to Timbul & Sinambela (2013), there are two groups of factors that affect job satisfaction. The first factor is organizational factors, which include company policies and work environment. Another factor is the individual or teacher factor. Individual factors have two important predictors of job satisfaction, namely job title and seniority. Low status and routine jobs tend to make teachers look for other jobs, which means that these two factors can lead to job dissatisfaction, and teachers who have interests and challenges are more satisfied with their jobs when they can do it optimally.

Yukl (2019) claims that the best task of job satisfaction research is to pay attention to job factors and individual factors. Factors that affect job satisfaction include salary, working conditions, quality of care, co-workers, job type, job security, and opportunities for advancement, as well as individual factors related to their needs, values, and personality. Characteristic. Job satisfaction is a general attitude towards a person's job, or the difference between the compensation an employee receives and the amount he is believed to receive (Suhardi, 2019). Meanwhile, according to Aziz (2020), job satisfaction is a pleasant or unpleasant emotional state where employees experience their work. Job satisfaction reflects how a person feels about his job. The job satisfaction referred to in this article is the tendency of the teacher's attitude and feelings to like the work entrusted to him. So when a teacher is happy with his job as a teacher, then the teacher is happy with his work. Conversely, if the teacher himself is dissatisfied with the work entrusted to him, then job satisfaction has not been seen in the teacher concerned.

The results of the study (Handayani & Rasyid, 2015) and (Suyusman et al., 2020) show that teacher job satisfaction is closely related to the amount of remuneration received. However, the results of Suhardi's research (2019) concluded that there was no significant relationship between salary and job satisfaction. A factor affecting the job satisfaction of professional teachers is the organizational atmosphere. To achieve harmony between the parts of the organization, a favorable atmosphere must be created within the organization, that is, an atmosphere within the organization in which each member can interact, set work goals and further develop the members of the organization. Through the interaction process, members of the organization assess the trust, support, or openness to decisions made by members of the organization to work effectively and creatively, commit to the organization, embrace organizational opportunities. enthusiastically and innovatively Offer ideas for organizational improvement Creating a positive organizational atmosphere encourages job satisfaction in the organization (Adeniji, 2011; Castro & Martins, 2010; Putri & Destiwati, 2017; Susanty, 2012).

A positive organizational climate encourages organizational members to interact with each other and create cooperation between departments and minimize obstacles that may arise in the organization. A good organizational climate allows teachers to perform their duties calmly and without fear or discrimination, although organizations also have different target groups with different interests (Sanjaya, Irwansyah & Alunaza, 2017). Teachers who are satisfied with their work are highly committed and want to remain part of the school organization. Teachers whose job satisfaction increases will automatically increase their commitment to the organization. The level of job satisfaction has a significant influence on organizational commitment. According to research by Suderajat & Rojuaniah (2021), the relationship between these variables aroused the interest of researchers to study the relationship between these three variables at SMKN in Ciracas District, East Jakarta.

Individual commitment in an organization is the extent to which an individual devotes attention, ideas and responsibilities to achieving organizational goals. This is supported by the opinion of Colquitt (2009), who states: Organizational commitment is the desire of an employee to remain a member of the organization. Organizational commitment is a person's desire to continue working in the organization. Engagement is an important part of effective teaching. Teacher engagement is characterized by their commitment to the achievement of their students. Teachers who care about student development and work hard to maintain student progress, encourage students' curiosity and interest in learning, recognize their responsibilities to their students and strive to fulfill them. Teachers who are committed to their profession and committed to the development of their students.

Committed teachers are characterized by their commitment to achievement of their students. Commitment is an essential element of effective teaching. Committed teachers are concerned with the development of their students and they deeply struggle how to keep students' learning. They cultivate students' curiosity and interest in learning. Committed teachers recognize and effort to fulfill their responsibilities to their students. Teachers, who are engaged in their profession and committed to students and their learning, play a crucial role in development of students (Maiyani, 2017)

The relationship between the perceived strength of the performance management process and teacher performance appears to be circumstantial, operating primarily through affective organizational commitment. This is explained by Waeyenberg:

This resonates with the HRM literature more generally, in which motivation-enhancing HRM practices are theorized to contribute to operational outcomes such as employee performance, by first improving valuable employee attitudes such as, for example, satisfaction, motivation and commitment. The relationship between perceived performance management process strength and teacher performance appeared to be indirect, operating primarily through affective organizational commitment. (Van Waeyenberg et al., 2020)

Commitment is an essential element of effective teaching. Committed teachers are characterized by their commitment to the achievements of their students. Committed teachers care about student development and strive to maintain learning, foster students' curiosity and interest in learning, recognize and strive to fulfill responsibilities to their students. Teachers who are engaged in the profession and committed to the development of students.

Committed teachers are characterized by their commitment to achievement of their students. Commitment is an essential element of effective teaching. Committed teachers are concerned with the development of their students and they deeply struggle how to keep students' learning. They cultivate students' curiosity and interest in learning. Committed teachers recognize and effort to fulfill their responsibilities to their students. Teachers, who are engaged in their profession and committed to students and their learning, play a crucial role in development of students (Maiyani, 2017).

In other words, acceptance commitment refers to how a person accepts the values of his chosen job or work area and has a desire to maintain membership in that job. Commitment to a position is the way a person responds to the work done.

The organizational and professional commitment of teachers is related to the implementation of school goals, loyalty to their values, and willingness to fight for the school. As explained by Cansoy Teachers' organizational and professional commitment is related to adopting the goals of the school, loyalty to their values and willingness to strive for the school. (Cansoy et al., 2020)

Teacher commitment is defined as the teacher's "psychological attachment" to the teaching profession, professional associations and schools, colleagues, parents and students." Teacher commitment is classified into three types: commitment to the teaching profession, to students, and to school. Only the teacher's commitment to students is defined as "the teacher's devotion and responsibility to student learning" and behavior." as quoted by Park, et. Al:

Teacher commitment is defined as "teachers' psychological attachment to the teaching profession, professional associations and school, colleagues, parents and students." As a

multidimensional construct, teacher commitment is classified into three types: commitment to the teaching profession, to the students, and to the school. Only the teacher commitment to students was taken into account in this study, which is defined as teacher's "devotion to and responsibility for student learning and behavior." (Park, 2005; Lee et al., 2011; Frelin and Fransson, 2017)

Colquitt, Lepine and Wesson (2009), explained that there are 3 (three) types of commitments, including: affective commitment, continuu commitment and sustainable normative commitment, among others:

- a) Affective commitment as desire to a member of an organization due to an emotional attachment to, and involment with, that organization put simply, you stay because you want to
- b) Continue commitment as a desire to remain a member of an organization because of an awareness of the costs associated with leaving it. In other words, you stay because you need to.
- c) Normative commitment as a desire to remain a member of an organizations due to a feeling of obligation. In this case, you stay because you ought to.

From the three commitments above, it can be seen that affective commitment is the desire to remain a member of an organization because of emotional attachment and organizational involvement. You stay because you want to, then you stay committed because you want to stay a member of the organization, because you understand the cost of exiting, i.e. you stay because you have to, and normative commitment is the desire to remain a member. organization due to a sense of responsibility. In this case you stay because you have to, for example.

At the same time, other studies have also shown a positive relationship between organizational commitment and job satisfaction (Natarajan, 2011). There is a correlation between teachers' commitment to the organization and the job satisfaction achieved. A high level of commitment to the company means that teachers have little intention of leaving their jobs. A high level of commitment to the organization also ensures that teachers enjoy their work and interest in the best work as teachers increases. Therefore commitment is an important factor for job satisfaction in organizations.

Given that previous studies have explained the effect of organizational climate and organizational commitment on job satisfaction, it is very interesting to conduct research on variables that have been studied separately to test them in a research model. The justification of the research conducted in the model is based on the idea that overall (holistic) job satisfaction should be understood as a response to various aspects of the workplace caused both by oneself (personal) and by the resulting social interactions (Perloff, 2017).

The purpose of this study is to analyze the relationship between: 1) organizational climate with teacher job satisfaction, 2) commitment with teacher job satisfaction and 3) climate and commitment together with teacher job satisfaction.

## **METHOD**

The research was conducted at SMK in Ciracas District, East Jakarta with a population of 362 teachers. Using the Slovin formula with an error rate of 0.05, a simple random sample of 191 teachers was taken. Test the hypothesis using a correlation test. For the measurement of job satisfaction variables, five dimensions are used: namely interest in work done with indicators (1) diligent work and (2) increasing competence. The dimensions of awards received with indicators (1) compensation and (2) promotion. The supervisor's ability dimension provides technical assistance with indicators: (1) academic supervision and (2) clinical supervision. Co-worker support dimensions with indicators of (1) moving together and (2) supporting each other achieving goals

Organizational climate variables measured through dimensions: a. organizational characteristics with indicators: (1) morale, (2) trust. The dimension of regularity acts with indicators: (1) supporting school rules, (2) respecting school traditions. The dimensions of norms adhered to by indicators: (1) socialization of norms, (2) understanding norms, (3) implementation of norms. The measurement of organizational commitment variables uses three dimensions,

namely (1) constancy, (2) engagement, and (3) loyalty. The indicators are dimensions of constancy, namely: the desire to keep working and the desire to be in line with the vision, mission and goals of the school. Indicators of the engagement dimension are the desire to actively engage and the desire to contribute. Indicators of the loyalty dimension are the desire to be loyal to the school and the desire to be responsible for the school.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

**1. The Relationship between Organizational Climate and Job Satisfaction of Vocational Teachers**

Based on the results of the study, it can be stated that the organizational climate has a significant relationship with the job satisfaction of SMKN teachers in Ciracas District, East Jakarta. This is evidenced from the results of the r test statistical test for organizational climate with the acquisition of a calculated r value of 0.472, a value of  $\beta = 0.373$  and a t value = 7.360 with a significant value of 0.000 which is smaller than 0.05 with the following calculation:

Model	Variables Entered	Variables Removed	Method
1	Organizational Climate <sup>b</sup>		. Enter

a. Dependent Variable: Teacher Job Satisfaction

b. All requested variables entered.

**Model Summary**

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	,472a	,223	,219	9,804

a. Predictors: (Constant), Organizational Climate

**ANOVA<sup>a</sup>**

Model		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Itself.
1	Regression	5206,098	1	5206,098	54,166	,000b
	Residual	18165,650	189	96,115		
	Total	23371,749	190			

a. Dependent Variable: Teacher Job Satisfaction

b. Predictors: (Constant), Organizational Climate

**Coefficients<sup>a</sup>**

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Itself.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	60,882	4,087		14,898	,000
	Organizational Climate	,373	,051	,472	7,360	,000

a. Dependent Variable: Teacher Job Satisfaction

**2. The relationship between commitment and job satisfaction of vocational teachers**

Based on the results of the study, it can be stated that commitment has a significant relationship with job satisfaction of SMKN teachers in Ciracas District, East Jakarta. This is evidenced from the results of the statistical test of the r test for commitment with the acquisition of a calculated r value of 0.468, a value of  $\beta = 0.372$  and a value of  $t = 7.289$  with a significant value of 0.000 which is smaller than 0.05 with the following calculation:

**Variables Entered/Removed<sup>a</sup>**

Model	Variables Entered	Variables Removed	Method
1	Komitmenb		. Enter

- a. Dependent Variable: Teacher Job Satisfaction
- b. All requested variables entered.

**Model Summary**

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	,468a	,219	,215	9,825

- a. Predictors: (Constant), Komitmen

**ANOVA<sup>a</sup>**

Model		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Itself.
1	Regression	5127,861	1	5127,861	53,123	,000b
	Residual	18243,887	189	96,529		
	Total	23371,749	190			

- a. Dependent Variable: Teacher Job Satisfaction
- b. Predictors: (Constant), Commitment

**Coefficients<sup>a</sup>**

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Itself.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	59,928	4,255		14,085	,000
	Commitment	,372	,051	,468	7,289	,000

- a. Dependent Variable: Teacher Job Satisfaction

**3. The relationship between organizational climate and commitment together with teacher job satisfaction**

Based on the results of the study, it can be stated that the organizational climate and commitment together with the job satisfaction of SMKN teachers in Ciracas District, East Jakarta. This is evidenced from the results of the r test statistical test for Principal Academic Supervision with the acquisition of a calculated r value of 0.590,  $\beta = 0.294$  and 0.292 and  $t = 6.101$  and 6.021 with a significant value of 0.000 which is smaller than 0.05 with the following calculation:

**Variables Entered/Removed<sup>a</sup>**

Model	Variables Entered	Variables Removed	Method
1	Commitment, Organizational Climate <sup>b</sup>		. Enter

- a. Dependent Variable: Teacher Job Satisfaction

b. All requested variables entered.

**Model Summary**

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	,590a	,348	,341	9,000

a. Predictors: (Constant), Commitment, Organizational Climate

**ANOVAa**

Model		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Itself.
1	Regression	8142,935	2	4071,467	50,262	,000b
	Residual	15228,814	188	81,004		
	Total	23371,749	190			

a. Dependent Variable: Teacher Job Satisfaction

b. Predictors: (Constant), Commitment, Organizational Climate

Coefficientsa

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Itself.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	43,073	4,777		9,016	,000
	Organizational Climate	,294	,048	,373	6,101	,000
	Commitment	,292	,049	,368	6,021	,000

a. Dependent Variable: Teacher Job Satisfaction

From the three commitments above, it can be seen that affective commitment is the desire to remain a member of an organization because of emotional attachment and organizational involvement. You stay because you want to, then you stay committed because you want to stay a member of the organization, because you understand the cost of getting out, that is, you stay because you have to, and normative commitment is the desire to remain a member. organization due to a sense of responsibility. In this case you stay because you have to, for example.

At the same time, other studies have also shown a positive relationship between organizational commitment and job satisfaction (Natarajan, 2011). There is a correlation between teachers' commitment to the organization and the job satisfaction achieved. A high level of commitment to the company means that teachers have little intention of leaving their jobs. A high level of commitment to the organization also ensures that teachers enjoy their work and interest in the best work as teachers increases. Therefore commitment is an important factor for job satisfaction in organizations.

Given that previous studies have explained the effect of organizational climate and organizational commitment on job satisfaction, it is very interesting to conduct research on variables that have been studied separately to test them in a research model. The justification of the research conducted in the model is based on the idea that overall (holistic) job satisfaction should be understood as a response to various aspects of the workplace caused both by oneself (personal) and by the resulting social interactions (Perloff, 2017).

From the three commitments above, it can be seen that affective commitment is the desire to remain a member of an organization because of emotional attachment and organizational involvement. You stay because you want to, then you stay committed because you want to stay a member of the organization, because you understand the cost of getting out, that is, you stay because you have to, and normative commitment is the desire to remain a member. organization due to a sense of responsibility. In this case you stay because you have to, for example.

At the same time, other studies have also shown a positive relationship between organizational commitment and job satisfaction (Natarajan, 2011). There is a correlation between teachers' commitment to the organization and the job satisfaction achieved. A high level of commitment to the company means that teachers have little intention of leaving their jobs. A high level of commitment to the organization also ensures that teachers enjoy their work and interest in the best work as teachers increases. Therefore commitment is an important factor for job satisfaction in organizations.

Studies on organizations always interest researchers to understand what and how organizational behavior, or to find out solutions to various problems faced by an organization. Because, like living humans who are always faced with various problems, the organization also seems to never be empty of various life problems. There are always problems that arise that must be solved. Or administrators must carry out various efforts, ways, strategies and tactics to achieve the vision and mission of their organization. It can be said, one of the keys to the success of an organization lies in the communication aspect of managers in carrying out organizational activities.

The selection of compensation, commitment and job satisfaction as variables is because researchers see several previous studies that show the relationship between these three variables. Previous research by Suderajat & Rojuaniah, (2021) showed that teacher professional compensation can increase organizational commitment, meaning that in conditions where professional allowances increase, organizational commitment and vice versa if allowances decrease, organizational commitment decreases. also. Professional allowances can increase job satisfaction, in other words if professional allowances will directly increase teachers' job satisfaction at work. The higher the allowance, the higher the job satisfaction and vice versa if the professional allowance is reduced or eliminated it will affect job satisfaction. Job satisfaction can increase organizational commitment.

## CONCLUSION

This research is based on the starting point that job satisfaction can be explained not only by one variable, but can be explained by a combination of various variables). This starting point or assumption is based on the results of previous expert research that has proven that job satisfaction can be influenced by more than one variable.

Based on this starting point, researchers see a gap in thinking to examine the integration of the influence of organizational climate variables and organizational commitment to job satisfaction in one research model. To get a more comprehensive picture of the effect of each variable on job satisfaction, a causal relationship analysis was carried out using the SPSS program version 24.

In general, the results of the study prove that the job satisfaction of teachers working at SMK Ciracas District can be influenced by organizational climate variables and commitment variables. As for suggestions for research related to the integration model of the influence of organizational climate variables and organizational commitment to job satisfaction, it can be done in the scope of work of private organizations.

## REFERENCES

- Adeniji, A. A. (2011). Organizational climate as a predictor of employee job satisfaction: evidence from covenant university. *Business Intelligence Journal*, 4(1), 151–166.
- Cansoy, R., Parlar, H., & Polatcan, M. (2020). Collective teacher efficacy as a mediator in the relationship between instructional leadership and teacher commitment. *International Journal of Leadership in Education*, 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13603124.2019.1708470>
- Castro, M. L., & Martins, N. (2010). The relationship between organisational climate and employee satisfaction in a south african information and technology organization. *SA Journal of Industrial Psychology*, 36(1), 1–9.



- Colquitt, Jason A., LePine., J. A., & Wesson, M. J. (2009). *Organizational Behaviour*. McGraw-Hill International.
- Harivarman, D. (2017). Internal communication barriers in government organizations. *ASPIKOM Journal-Journal of Communication Sciences*, 3(3), 508–519.
- Maiyani, N. J. (2017). Committed Teacher: Teacher Commitment and Dedication to Student Learning. *International Journal of Research and Analytical Reviews*, 4(4), 2348–2349.
- Natarajan, N. K. (2011). Relationship of organizational commitment with job satisfaction. *Indian Journal of Commerce & Management Studies*, 2(1), 118–122.
- Nugraheni, D. O., & Prasetyo, A. R. (2021). Job Insecurity and Work Motivation for Honorary Elementary School Teachers in Binangun District, Cilacap Regency. *Journal of EMPATHY*, 10(4), 277–286. <https://doi.org/10.14710/empati.2021.32604>
- Perloff, R. M. (2017). The dynamics of persuasion: communication and attitudes in the 21st century. *The Dynamics of Persuasion: Communication and Attitudes in the Twenty-First Century*, 1–628. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315657714>
- Putri, Y. A., & Destiwati, R. (2017). The effect of service quality of Telkom University Language Center on service user satisfaction. *Journal of Communication Studies*, 5(1), 102–110.
- Sanjaya, A., Alunaza, H. (2017). Maintenance of organizational relationships and communication via cyber media. *Journal of Communication Sciences*, 14(2), 239–258.
- Sari, A. K., Giatman, M., & Ernawati, E. (2022). Teaching factory learning management in improving the competence of students majoring in cosmetology in vocational high schools. *JRTI (Indonesian Journal of Action Research)*, 7(2), 148. <https://doi.org/10.29210/30031696000>
- Siahaan, Y. L. O., & Meilani, R. I. (2019). Compensation and Job Satisfaction System for Non-Permanent Teachers in a Private Vocational School in Indonesia. *Journal of Office Management Education*, 4(2), 141. <https://doi.org/10.17509/jpm.v4i2.18008>
- Suderajat, & Rojuaniah. (2021). THE EFFECT OF TEACHER PROFESIONAL ALLOWANCE AND JOB SATISFACTION TOWARD ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT (A Study on Private Islamic Junior High Schools Teachers in Tangerang Regency). *INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SOCIAL AND MANAGEMENT STUDIES (IJOSMAS)*, 2(2).
- Susanty, E. (2012). The effect of organizational climate on job satisfaction and teacher commitment to open universities. *Journal of Organization and Management*, 8(2), 121–134.
- Tambak, S. R., Elvina, E., & Yudi Prayoga. (2022). The Effect of Career Development, Compensation, Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment on Employee Retention and Work Environment of PT. Marbau Jaya Indah Raya. *Tambusai Education*, 6(2). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31004/jptam.v6i2.4089>
- Van Waeyenberg, T., Peccei, R., & Decramer, A. (2020). Performance management and teacher performance: the role of affective organizational commitment and exhaustion. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 1–24. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585192.2020.1754881>
- 

**Copyright holder:**

Bunyamin (2022)

**First publication right:**

Journal of Social Science

**This article is licensed under:**

