

# Career Development of State Civil Apparatus at Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency

Yana Grice Soway, Marthinus Mandagi, Fitri Herawati Mamonto

Manado State University, Tondano, North Sulawesi, Indonesia

Email: yanagricesouray@gmail.com, marthinusmandagi@unima.ac.id,  
yombog@yahoo.com

## ARTICLE INFO

Date received : 08 February 2022  
Revision date : 20 February 2022  
Date received : 02 March 2022

### Keywords:

Career development, education qualification, competence

## ABSTRACT

This research aims to analyze the implementation of career development of state civil servants at Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency. The focus of this research includes two indicators of competency education qualifications. This research uses qualitative research methods and data collection techniques: Observation, Interview, and Documentation. Primary data of this research are Civil Servants at Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency, and secondary data are documents, archives, and related literature. The results showed that the Civil Service and Human Resources Development Agency of Central Tomohon is generally are preparing for the career development implementation. It can be seen from the performance not going well since there are no regional regulations that technically regulate career development, educational qualifications in structural positions in the placement of educational background are not under the field, or cognate and competency standards in the class have no technical competence. The advice given is career development in Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency. Thus, evaluating employees' placement based on educational background qualifications and field is needed. Regional regulations competency standards in career development are immediately made to map competency standards for employees at Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency.

## Introduction

Civil Servants are Apparatus Resources in charge of carrying out government tasks and providing services to meet the needs of the public or society in a professional and quality manner. To carry out this role, it is necessary to manage Civil Servants as human resources in government organizations so that they can play a more effective and efficient role (Meithiana & Ansory, 2019). Professionalization of the civil servants, based on meritocracy, efficiency, effectiveness, transparency, and accountability to community, is a critical component of assuring public administration's competitiveness (Shegenovna, 2014).

Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus, Article 68 states that State Civil Apparatuses are appointed in certain positions in Government agencies based on an objective comparison between the competencies, qualifications, and requirements required by the position in question (Atmosudirdjo, 1990). The implementation of the policy is expected to be able to realize and create qualified Civil Servants of Bureaucratic Apparatus who have competence and professionalism in carrying out their duties and positions. The implementation of public services will be realized determined by various factors, including the professionalism of the apparatus, while to get

How To Cite: Soway, Y. G., Mandagi, M., & Mamonto., F. H. (2022). Career Development of State Civil Apparatus at Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency. *Journal of Social Science*, 3(2).

<https://doi.org/10.46799/jss.v3i2.319>

E-Issn: 2721-5202

Published By: Ridwan Institut

the demands of the organization need a professional apparatus, the quality of apparatus resources.

Management of State Civil Apparatus as a resource for the apparatus aim to create professional State Civil Apparatus Employees who are having basic value, ethical, professional values, free from political intervention, clean from ci practice (Bukit, Malusa, & Rahmat, 2017) (Kaswan, 2012). Management of the State Civil Apparatus is a function within the organization designed to maximize employee performance in maximizing organizational performance. One of the organizational activities to advance the capabilities of its employees is Employee Career Development (Cardoso, 2001).

Career development of the State Civil Apparatus is an essential activity since the career of the State Civil Apparatus is a necessity that must be developed within State Civil Apparatus to motivate employees to improve the performance. State Civil Apparatus career development includes every activity to prepare employees to take a particular path. Realistic career goals must accompany a career plan that an ASN has made. The purpose of State Civil Apparatus career development is to match the needs and goals of existing employees with the career opportunities available in the organization concerned.

However, the problem in the career development of the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency is there are still employees who occupy positions that are not by applicable regulations, both in terms of educational qualifications and competencies that are following the competency standards of the position in developing career policies on new competency standards. There are high-ranking officials; this is what makes the appointment of the State Civil Apparatus in structural positions of supervisory positions still based on the assessment of this leader, it can be seen that there are still obstacles in the professional development of the state civil apparatus by the qualifications and competencies of the state civil apparatus.

Regulation of the State Civil Service Agency, Number 28 of 2020 concerning Preparation of Career Development Plans for Civil Servants Article 2, states that Career Development is part of the career management of Civil Servants at the agency and national level, in carrying out career management of PNS government agencies must prepare: Competency Standards and Profiles of State Civil Apparatus. Moreover, Article 3 states that career development is carried out based on

qualifications, competencies, performance appraisals, and the needs of government agencies.

To realize professional and competent human resources for civil servants with career development for State Civil Apparatus, which is carried out based on a combination of work performance and career systems, the development of human resources for personnel using development method is a must to make organizations achieve better performance and provide the best public services (Pujiasri, 2018). Moreover, training is a continual human resources management function that helps employees adjust to new conditions or surroundings, along with improve the decision-making and problem-solving abilities in these situations (Ozkaser, 2019).

The existence of the State Civil Apparatus in improving the quality of human resources needs attention with a strategy to improve its quality and competence (Siagian, 2004). The improvement of the State Civil Apparatus competence in carrying out bureaucratic tasks or positions through training and education must be oriented to job competency standards according to the challenges of bureaucratic reform and management globalization (Leuwol et al., 2020). The quality of the apparatus cannot be increased without substantial efforts to improve it (Purnaya, 2016). This is where competence becomes one of the characteristics that underlie an individual or a person to achieve high work performance.

Improving the Quality of Human Resources of the State Civil Apparatus can be in the form of knowledge, skills, and behavior to create state civil servants who have a high spirit of service in serving the community who always act efficiently, rationally, transparently, and accountable (Sedarmayanti & Pd, 2001) (Siregar et al., 2020). For this reason, a method for developing the competence of the State Civil Apparatus, Competence Development or qualifications is needed aiming to develop adequate human resources, which is an absolute thing that needs to be understood and implemented by all levels of local government apparatus in each agency.

Based on the research background, the authors are interested in conducting research on **"Career Development of State Civil Apparatus at Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency"**.

The problem formulation in this research is How is the Career Development of the State Civil Apparatus in the Regional Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency of Tomohon?

Various theories and experts' thoughts reveal aspects of human resources in an organization.

Various work units in the government environment are the most strategic sources organizations utilization to achieve organizational goals.

Human resource management always tries to integrate its strategies into organization to achieve organizational goals; therefore, in this case, human resource management more than just a collection of activities related to coordinating human resources (Mondy, 2008). Human resource management has a significant role in the organization's overall success (Nurdiansyah, 2019). One of the goals of human resource management is to ensure that the organization has a motivated and high-performing workforce, and is equipped with the means to deal with change that can meet the needs of its employees. To support the achievement of a motivated and high-performing workforce, this is done by fulfilling the needs.

Human Resources is an important factor in an organization since human resources are a collection of a group of people who work together to achieve certain goals. Whatever the form and purpose, organizations are made based on various visions for the benefit of humans and in carrying out the missions are managed by humans (Hanggraeni, 2012). Thus humans are a strategic factor in all organizational activities.

Development is a personal improvement carried out by a person to achieve a career plan and an increase by the personnel department to achieve a work plan following the path or level of the organization.

Career is the overall job/position that a person can occupy during his life in the organization or in several organizations. From the employee's point of view, the position is significant because everyone wants a wished or wanted position with the highest possible position based on the responsibilities and abilities.

Sulistiyorini (2017) suggests that career development is a change in values, attitudes, and motivations due to becoming increasingly getting older. The two meanings of these perspectives only focus on an individual and state or assume that each individual has some degree of control over destiny, then it can be said that people manipulate an opportunity in maximizing, advancing, implementing in order to achieve success and satisfaction career. The opinion above concludes that career development is a series that has a solid connection to changes in attitudes, mentality, values, and behavior and motivation occur in every individual's life span to form and find patterns clearly in skills, career goals and the need for development, plan the career goals that have been

set, and continuously evaluate, revise and improve the entire design.

Career development means a condition that indicate an increase and development of a person's status in work of an organization where the organization has established a career development process for all employees and workers. Career development is important, the impact on employee performance, where there is an increase in an employee's career development program implementing all of career goals (career planning) and how an organization can design and implement career development programs.

## METHOD

This study uses qualitative research based on the philosophy of postpositivism, used to examine the condition of natural objects, where the researcher is the key instrument, the data collection technique is done by triangulation (combined observation, interviews, documentation). According to (Sugiono, 2013), the data obtained tend to be qualitative data, data analysts are inductive/qualitative and qualitative research results are to understand meaning, understand uniqueness, construct phenomena, and find hypotheses.

Based on the mentioned explanation above, it can be concluded that the Qualitative Research Method aims to understand the phenomena that occur in individuals or groups and then describe them in words or sentences. The researcher chose to use the qualitative research method to understand the Development of the State Civil Apparatus at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency.

## Research Focus and Focus Description

The focus in this study is limited to Career Development in the Tomohon's Regional Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency. To reveal some facts behind the phenomenon, the researcher uses several indicators as a tool for this research based on:

1. Educational Qualifications  
Educational qualifications in Career Development are seen from the placement of a State Civil Apparatus in Supervisory Positions that are not in accordance with the educational qualifications in the technical positions held.
2. Competence  
Competence here seen from the Competency Standards based on the standard of competence in the placement of officials which determines an employee is worthy of the position with the competency standards

possessed according to the employee's expertise.

**Research sites**

This research was conducted at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency. The researcher chose this research location since the researcher worked at the Agency for Personnel and Human Resources Development.

Consideration of reaching the location makes it easier and more accessible for researchers to conduct research and be useful in the research process, easily available at the research location, and the data obtained by researchers is accurate and can be accounted for.

**Data and Data Sources**

Data is something related to information about a fact found by researchers at the research location. Two types of data will be used in this study, there are:

1. Primary Data is the first source that is obtained directly on the resource, there are 5 people, starting from the highest leadership, namely the Secretary of the Personnel Agency, Head of Division, and Head of Sub-Section at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency.
2. Secondary data is the second source of data after primary data, which is obtained indirectly to support research through documents and various literatures that support the completeness of primary data relating to career development of the State Civil Apparatus at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency.

In general, the data sources in qualitative research are categorized as follows:

1. Informants  
Informants in this study are people who can provide information about the research situation and conditions. The informants in this study are:

**Table 1**  
**Table of Informants**

No.	Data Sources	Informant	Total
1	Supervisor	EK	2
	Secretary of Division	ET	
	Head of Division		
2	Head of Sub-division	HW	3
		YW	
		JE	

2. Events  
Researchers use events to find out the process of something more definitely because they witnessed it firsthand, in this case, the researcher observed and knew directly related to the career development of the State Civil Apparatus.
3. Documentation  
Documentation is written material or objects related to certain events. Documentation in this study is in the form of written notes, recordings, pictures or objects related to all matters related to the research focus.

**Data Collection Techniques**

The data were collected through three techniques, including:

1. Observation  
Data collection techniques were carried out by observing various phenomena and events at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development, especially those related to the State Civil Apparatus Career Development at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency.
2. Interview  
Data collection techniques by asking several oral questions through Questions and Answers directed to informants. The interview refers to the guidelines that have been made, but it is possible to ask a number of new questions that can support the validity of the data.
3. Documentation  
Documentation to collect various written information in the form of regulations regarding State Civil Apparatus career development and other related data from the institution's research location.

**Data Analysis Techniques**

Qualitative research emphasizes the importance of exploring emic to understand deeply. Looking for processes, patterns, themes, and models with diverse data collection methods, namely observation, interviews, and document analysis (Miles B. Matthew, Huberman Michael, 2009) (Sugiarto, 2017). Analysis of qualitative descriptive data in this study was carried out using an interactive data analysis design according to Milles & Hubberman (1984), where the activities started from data collection in the field, data reduction, data presentation, and the last stage was concluding.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

**A. Tomohon's Regional Human Resources Development Agency**

Based on Regional Regulation Number 9 of 2018 concerning Amendments to Regional Regulation number 6 of 2016 concerning the Formation and Structure of the Tomohon Regional Apparatus, it is stated that the Type C Human Resources Development and Personnel Agency carries out the functions of supporting staffing as well as education and training.

The Agency for Personnel and Human Resources Development is a supporting element for government affairs in the field of personnel and human resource development led by the Head of the Agency which is located under and responsible to the Mayor through the Regional Secretary.

The Tomohon's Regional Human Resources Development Personnel Agency has the main task of assisting the Mayor in carrying out government duties in carrying out the management of the state civil apparatus in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.

**Tabel 2  
Research Findings**

Research Focus	Research Findings
Educational Qualification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Structural Officials who serve in a position have not been in line with educational background.</li> <li>- Structural Officials who serve in a position have not followed leadership training.</li> </ul>
Competences	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Career development has not been implemented as seen from the preparation of the mayor's regulation on the merit system, in this case to regulate the career pattern of <i>ASN</i> in Tomohon.</li> <li>- Inavailability of system or database such as talent pool that can identify employees' competencies.</li> <li>- The new position competency standars have been prepared for high positions, while for administrators and supervisors the competency standars for organizational improvement is still missing.</li> </ul>

Based on table 2, it can be seen that Career Development of the State Civil Apparatus has not been implemented and appropriately realized because from the Government and from the State Civil Apparatus itself there are still many obstacles that have not supported Career Development in an agency.

**B. Educational Qualifications**

According to Simamora (2006), career development is a formal approach taken by organizations to ensure that people with the

right qualifications and experience are available when needed because career planning and development benefit both individuals and organizations.

Based on observations and research conducted by researchers regarding Career Development in Structural Positions at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency, whether it is by the expectations of employees at the office, it is concluded that it is not by applicable regulations because the structural position of the employee occupying the position has a background education is not by the duties, principal, and functions.

Furthermore, for the appointment of employees carried out is a direct assessment from superiors, so the promotion of positions carried out by the leadership is good, for that employees must be included in leadership training, but what happened at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency three officials have not attended leadership training. In running the organization and achieving organizational goals, efforts need to be made to improve the human resources within the organization properly. Career development is the success of human resource management in the organization. This reveals that career development is a success for human resources. However, in an organization found to be less good, the level of success of human resource management in the organization is also not good. Success or success has always been the hope and desire for everyone. Employees who work in organizations are seen as successful from their career progress which has increased, it can also be seen that employees work according to their duties, principals, and functions whose performance is satisfactory and achieves in their work, there will be a clear opportunity in achieving their career. And if the employee has worked hard and excelled but there is no career path reward, it does not provide positive stimulation at work.

The career development indicators based on Sulistyorini (2019) involves:

1. Educational background is one of the requirements to sit in a position. Education is an activity to improve the mastery of theory and skills to decide work problems to achieve goals.
2. Training is a process of teaching certain knowledge and skills and attitudes so that employees are more skilled and able to carry



out their responsibilities better and in the end the training can support the achievement of company goals.

3. Work experience, is the level of mastery of a person's knowledge and skills, can be measured from a person's tenure.

From the indicators, there are three career development indicators first, educational background is a requirement to sit in a position as a result of observations at the research location, namely Structural Officers in occupying positions that are not in accordance with educational background in the field of science. Structural positions at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency can be seen in a sub-sector head whose educational background should be suitable in other fields but is still placed in a position that does not match the educational background. Leaders and leaders feel that he is worthy of that position, but in terms of education, the appropriate field is not yet appropriate. For this reason, it is necessary to occupy structural positions, the requirements for educational qualifications are formulated in the lowest level of education that is suitable for occupying positions or the ability to perform job duties under normal conditions. The level of educational qualification is formulated by analyzing the relevance or direct relationship with the ability to carry out tasks or to have the competence of a position that has been formulated and determined that it must be in accordance with the field. If it follows the field, it will be easier to manage career development and help make work easier and according to the appropriate knowledge.

The second indicator is training, which is a process of teaching certain knowledge and skills and attitudes so that employees are more skilled and able to carry out their responsibilities better and in the end the training can support the achievement of company goals. There are 2 in-service training for State Civil Apparatus, namely Pre-service and in-service training. Furthermore, this education and training or leadership training is a requirement for leadership competence in the government sector in accordance with the levels of structural positions which according to the classification level are Pim Education and Training Level I, Pim Education and Training Level II, Pim Education and Training Level III, and Pim Training Level IV in the Civil Service Agency and Human Resources Development of Tomohon City structural officials who serve in a position have not attended leadership training

which will be a provision someday in carrying out their duties.

In following this leadership training because there has not been an opportunity in the implementation of the leadership training itself even though an official should have held a position of at least 1 year, but in this training it has not been held, it has only been held for the training of Candidates for State Civil Apparatus. In contrast, the leadership training has not been held due to factors Among other things, such as the provision of a budget, the provision of a budget has been provided. However, due to the Covid-19 Virus, there have been budget re-couplings which have made this training and education program run, it can be seen that the importance of education and training programs for an organization to develop human resources have the ability to occupy a position.

The third indicator is work experience, the level of mastery of a person's knowledge and skills, which a person's tenure can measure. Level of work experience does not guarantee that employees can occupy a structural position at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency. It has been high but has not been promoted to structural positions. However, those who are still junior and whose ranks are below have occupied structural positions, thus positioning has not been seen measured by length of work or skills mastery.

### C. Competence

According to [Wibowo \(2007\)](#) competence is an ability to carry out or perform a job or task based on skills and knowledge and is supported by the work attitude required by the job. Career development is carried out in developing the competence of each employee. Career development at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency already exists, but still needs to be developed by conducting competency mapping. Competency mapping for each employee is mapped through competency tests or competency assessments. For the preparation of this career development, the first thing to do is to draw up a Tomohon Mayor Regulation and career development will be carried out, however in the Personnel Agency it is still in the preparation. Then career development program should have competency standards that contains Managerial Competence, Socio-cultural competence, and technical

competence as well as the educational background of each employee.

In the preparation of Competency Standards at the Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency, there is only a policy for high Pratama positions, while for administrative positions, supervisory positions, and implementing positions there is no policy for competency standards. It is still in the preparation of the legal basis and there is no mapping of competency standards for each employee. However, the preparation of this competency standard of has problems, such as compiling this competency standard one must look at the competency dictionary, but for the new competency dictionary there is a managerial competency dictionary and a socio-cultural competency dictionary for a technical competency dictionary there is not any yet.

Career development should be carried out in accordance with the competency mapping of each employee. If career development has been mapped out, a career pattern will be formed, and careers will be developed for each State Civil Apparatus in accordance with the needs of the existing position.

Systems or databases such as a talent pool that can identify the competencies of employees who have potential in managing the management of the state civil apparatus have carried out potential and competency activities for employee positions, and there is no technical competency dictionary. This will help the State Civil Apparatus in planning future careers more. So, this database is essential to identify employees who can occupy positions that are suitable for careers in state civil servants.

For the competency standard for new positions, there is a policy drawn up for Primary High Positions, while for Administrators and Supervisors there is no competency standard due to constraints on the technical dictionary which does not yet exist, indeed this competency standard must have been implemented under applicable regulations so that the career pattern of the State Civil Apparatus can be useful. for organizations and of course, it can be helpful for individuals where the potential of human resources in carrying out work as state civil servants has been identified with employee data and is appropriate if placed in appropriate positions and according to their knowledge, potential, and competence.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the discussion of the research results in the previous chapter, the researcher can draw conclusions regarding the Development of the State Civil Apparatus at Tomohon's Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency as follows:

Educational Qualifications in Supervisory Positions have not been placed by cognate educational qualifications under the technical fields assigned.

The competences seen from the new competency standards exists for the Primary High Leadership Position. In contrast, the Administrative Position does not yet exist since there has not been a mapping of employee competency standards. Career development has not been implemented as seen from the preparation of the Mayor's regulation regarding the merit system to regulate the career pattern of State Civil Apparatus throughout Tomohon. There is no system or database such as a talent pool that can identify employees' competencies, and there is no technical competency dictionary and standards. New Position Competencies are prepared for Primary High Positions, while for Administrators and Supervisors, there is no competency standard yet

## Suggestions

Based on the description of the conclusions, the following suggestions can be submitted:

It is necessary to evaluate the placement of positions in the placement of structural positions that are in accordance with the educational background at the Tomohon Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency, thus the employees who are placed can be responsible according to their education and can be useful for the agency.

Compilation of competency standards. Competency standards positions in the Tomohon City Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency for career development should be arranged according to competency standards then competency mapping is made and if competencies have been mapped, the careers of each Civil Servant will be developed.

## REFERENCES

- Atmosudirdjo, S. Prajudi. (1990). *Dasar-dasar administrasi Negara. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia.*
- Bukit, Benjamin, Malusa, Tasman, & Rahmat, Abdul. (2017). *Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia: Teori, Dimensi Pengukuran, dan*

- Implementasi dalam Organisasi. *Sleman, Yogyakarta: Zahir Publishing.* [Google Scholar](#)
- Cardoso, G. 2001. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*, Yogyakarta: Andi Offset [Google Scholar](#)
- Hanggraeni, Dewi. (2012). *Manajemen sumber daya manusia*. Universitas Indonesia Publishing. [Google Scholar](#)
- Kaswan, M. M. (2012). Manajemen sumber daya manusia untuk keunggulan bersaing organisasi. *Edisi Pertama. Cetakan Pertama. Penerbit Graha Ilmu. Yogyakarta.* [Google Scholar](#)
- Leuwol, Natasya Virginia, Wula, Paulina, Purba, Bonaraja, Marzuki, Ismail, Brata, Diah Puji Nali, Efendi, Moh Yusuf, Masrul, Masrul, Sahri, Sahri, Ahdiyati, Madya, & Sari, Ifit Novita. (2020). *Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia Perguruan Tinggi: Sebuah Konsep, Fakta dan Gagasan*. Yayasan Kita Menulis. [Google Scholar](#)
- Meithiana, Indrasari, & Ansory, H. (2019). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Indonesia pustaka.
- Mondy, R. Wayne. (2008). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Jilid 1.* [Google Scholar](#)
- Nurdiansyah, Haris dan Rahman Saepul Robbi. 2019. *Pengantar Manajemen*. Yogyakarta: Diandra Kreatif
- Ozkeser, B. (2019). Impact of training on employee motivation in human resources management. *Procedia Computer Science, 158*, 802–810. [Scopus](#)
- Pujiasri, Eny dan Budiningsih, Sri E. 2018. *Otomatisasi Tata Kelola Kepegawaian*. Jakarta: Gramedia Widiasarana Indonesia.
- Purnaya, I Gusti Ketut. 2016. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Yogyakarta: CV Andi Offset
- Sedarmayanti, M., & Pd, M. (2001). Sumber daya manusia dan produktivitas kerja. *Bandung: CV. Mandar Maju.* [Google Scholar](#)
- Shegenovna, Idrissova Aliya. (2014). Impact of the professionalism of civil service of Kazakhstan on political modernization. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 143*, 247–250. [Scopus](#)
- Siagian, S. P. (2004). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*, Bumi Aksara, Jakarta
- Siregar, Robert Tua, Sahir, Syafrida Hafni, Sisca, Sisca, Candra, Vivi, Wijaya, Andy, Masrul, Masrul, Sianturi, Efendi, Simarmata, Hengki M. P., Revida, Erika, & Purba, Sukarman. (2020). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Dalam Organisasi*. Yayasan Kita Menulis. [Google Scholar](#)
- Sugiarto, E. (2017). *Menyusun proposal penelitian kualitatif: Skripsi dan tesis: Suaka media*. Diandra Kreatif. [Google Scholar](#)
- Sugiono. (2013). *Memahami penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Penerbit Alfabeta.
- Wibowo, S. E., & Phil, M. (2007). *Manajemen Kinerja edisi tiga*. Jakarta: PT. Raja grafindo persada. [Google Scholar](#)

---

**Copyright holder:**

Yana Grice Soway, Marthinus Mandagi, Fitri Herawati (2022)

**First publication right:**

Journal of Social Science

**This article is licensed under:**

