Analyzing Social Studies National Curriculum and Textbooks for the Concept of Global Citizenship: A Content Analysis

Laraib Nasir Jalbani
Shaheed Zulfikar Ali Bhutto Institute of Science and Technology, Pakistan

Najmonnisa Khan
Shaheed Zulfikar Ali Bhutto Institute of Science and Technology, Pakistan

Abstract

This qualitative research study was an attempt to analyze the National Social Studies curriculum and textbooks of Grades IV-V in the context of Global Citizenship Education after reviewing the National Education Policies of Pakistan developed in 2009 and 2017. These two policies emphasize developing individuals who are critical thinkers, intellectuals, independent, and responsible global citizens. Data were collected with the help of a checklist for the relational content analysis of student learning outcomes, teaching and learning process, assessment, and evaluation process within the scope of 8 global citizenship dimensions given in the UNICEF global citizenship framework (2013). Major findings of the thematic analysis include the integration of global citizenship elements in the National Curriculum and textbooks of Social Studies to a great extent. Learning objectives as well as teaching and learning process designed for Grades IV and V emphasize the knowledge and understanding of 'Economic and political processes' and 'World Geography'. Similarly, the predominant dimensions identified in the assessment and evaluation exercises developed for Grade IV were 'Economic and political processes', 'Peace and conflict', and 'Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding,' whereas, knowledge and understanding of 'World Geography' and 'Awareness of diverse perspectives' had been emphasized in Grade V.

Keywords: Citizenship education, cultural literacy, global citizenship, global interdependence, National Education Policy of Pakistan, social studies curriculum

Introduction

Background of the Study

The history of education's developmental, civic, and global dimensions can be tracked over decades (McKay & Michael, 2021). Therefore, global citizenship has received close review after the First Initiative of United Nations Global Education (United Nations, 2012). Keeping in view its importance, the concept of Global Education has been highlighted in Sustainable Development Agenda goal 4.7, which is to be achieved by 2030. It has impacted European countries' political agendas and other countries globally, encouraging them to teach Global Citizenship in their educational institutions. UNESCO has promoted global citizenship education as a new educational approach that provides politicians, policymakers, theoreticians, and practitioners an opportunity to transform the education system as needed today. On that account, a new meaning can be given to issues of citizenship in global and plural societies along with multicultural education and sustainability of the environment (Obiakor, 2021).

The educational stakeholders are making efforts globally to integrate global citizenship teachings and practices into their institutions to promote global citizenship education among this generation. High schools, colleges, and universities in Pakistan have also introduced courses that can promote global citizenship among students as they are the current generation and future leaders. Therefore, there was a need to examine the concept of global citizenship in the National Curriculum and Textbook of Social Studies at the Primary level, Grades IV-V concerning the National Education Policy of Pakistan in 2009 and 2017.

Colleges and universities in Pakistan have introduced courses and subjects to promote global citizenship after the National Education Policies of Pakistan (2009; 2017) support not only building of national identity but also emphasize building tolerance and justice. According to the Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan (2009), the 7th objective of the Education policy document highlights that education aims to develop individuals of the society as critical thinkers, and intellectuals, and possess sound analytical skills for national as well as global citizenship. Likewise, the Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan (2017) highlights the importance of inculcating a sense of global citizenship among the students by promoting values of peace, tolerance, and respect for human rights. In

addition to that, it also aims to provide opportunities to learners so they can adjust to the global changes taking place frequently in the current era. It also aims to expand the academic disciplines which are synchronized with national priorities as well as global trends. Keeping in view all the aforementioned aims and objectives, a research gap has been identified: although this concept has been highlighted in the National Education Policy of Pakistan in 2009 and 2017, analysis and examination of the integration of global citizenship elements in the National curriculum of Pakistan have not been done (Saddiqa et al., 2020). Therefore, there was a need to analyze the concept of global citizenship in the curriculum and textbook of Social Studies developed for the province Sindh at the Primary level for Grades IV-V concerning the National Education Policy of Pakistan of 2009 and 2017. The aim is to determine the extent of commitment to the integration of global citizenship education attributes and dimensions in student learning outcomes, teaching and learning process as well as the assessment and evaluation in the curriculum.

Literature Review

Theoretical Framework

The theoretical framework of this research study is UNICEF Global Citizenship framework (2013). It has been developed on the ideology that to make responsible as well as global citizens, global awareness is the key objective and it is each individual's responsibility. Therefore, there is a rising demand put forward by educational institutes to be able to make active global citizens.

Table 1

UNICEF Global Citizenship Framework (2013)

Dimensions of Global Citizenship: Knowledge and Understandings	Skills and Processes	Values and Attitudes	Actions
Awareness of diverse perspectives Economic and political processes Environment and sustainable development Globalization and interdependence Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding Human rights Peace and conflict World geography	Collaboration and cooperation Communication, including verbal, nonverbal, written, and visual, in a variety of contexts Communication with individuals of diverse cultures Conflict resolution, including the ability to compromise and negotiate Critical and creative thinking Media, digital, and information literacy Multilingualism Perspective-taking	Comfort with ambiguity Commitment to social justice and equity Concern for the environment and commitment to sustainable practices Curiosity about the world Empathy for others Open-mindedness Respect for the rights of others Sense of identity and self-awareness Sense of responsibility for helping others Sense of unity with individuals and causes within and outside one's borders (solidarity) Values diversity	Acts to improve conditions through volunteerism and service Challenges injustice Engages in civic duties (individually and collectively) Establishes goals for taking informed action Evaluates the effectiveness of action to inform future action Helps others locally and globally Takes responsibility for actions

Note. Adopted from TTeach UNICEF by the U.S Fund for UNICEF's Education Department, 2013.

Social Studies as a Subject

Individuals living in a society have diverse needs; therefore, citizenship education plays a vital role in helping them socialize and be able to self-actualize. The importance of Social Studies as a subject cannot be neglected for it helps students socialize and learn democratic values to fit in the society (Lerch & Buckner, 2018). They become part of groups and join institutions at different points in their life. This relationship can be termed the essence of Social Studies (Brugar & Whitlock, 2020).

Citizens' attitude towards democratic values should be underscored so that the youth of a nation is enabled to participate in social life, considering it a responsibility (Ay & Tokcan, 2019). Schools perform one such important function which is to transfer cultural knowledge from one generation to another and prepare future citizens. Students, therefore, are expected to become responsible citizens after they realize their importance in a globally competitive world (Jamil et al., 2021). All these efforts are categorized under the paradigm of Global Citizenship within Social Studies subject. Additionally, according to Pérez (2018), students as responsible citizens become sensitive to social causes and events for the environmental crisis. The National Curriculum of Social Studies in Pakistan has been designed on interdisciplinary subjects such as History, Geography, Political Science, Inquiry, Economics, Civics, Pakistan Studies, and Ethics. Social Studies as a common platform provides an opportunity for interdisciplinary relationships. Therefore, one must be aware that even Sociology and Anthropology are related disciplines.

Global Citizenship by UNICEF

The U.S. Fund for UNICEF (2013) has defined a global citizen as one who understands the need for interconnectedness, can value and respect others' opinions and diversity, and can raise a voice against injustice as well as take an action personally. Therefore, students are equipped with the knowledge, and understanding of how to exercise their human rights to help and support one another in any part of the world.

Attributes of a Global Citizen
- Syaifullah et al. (2020) see a Global Citizen as somebody who:
- knows about the more extensive world and has their very own job as a citizen of the globe
- values and respect for diversity
- knows how the world functions
- discourages social injustice
- considers being a member of the community at all levels ranging from local to global
- will strive to make the world a fairer and more feasible place
- assumes liability for his/her actions

Global Citizenship: A Concern for Educational Institutions

Due to the present reality of global needs and demands evolving now and then, our young generation needs to equip themselves beyond the national limit, as global citizens (Estellés & Fischman, 2020). To stay up to date with the fast pace of the globalization, there must be a concern that endeavors in education ought to focus on expanding their attention to worldwide improvement and asking them to accept their obligations as natives of their local or regional, national, and worldwide communities (Pasha, 2015). In this manner, how to actualize and strengthen the component of worldwide citizenship education in-school educational programs has turned into a vital educational issue.

Characteristics of Global Citizenship Education

According to Pais & Costa (2020), following are the features of Global citizenship education:

- Comprehensive information about world political frameworks
- Comprehensive information about world monetary frameworks
- Critical reasoning abilities that rise above limits
- Cross-social relational abilities
- Provide dynamic commitment
- Develop sympathy: Global training must move to enable students to customize the world and disguise their associations with individuals living in a world far away (Pais & Costa, 2020).

Goals and Objectives of Global Citizenship Education

According to Jamil et al. (2021), the following are the objectives of global citizenship education:

1. Recognition of different nations and consciousness of their way of life.
2. Having awareness of global issues and problems, as well as the attitude of the United Nations toward solving them as its goals.
3. Identifying issues about human rights.
4. Understanding of connecting factors among humans and condition.

Research Questions

1. To what extent is the concept of global citizenship integrated into the Social Studies National curriculum and textbooks for Grades IV-V?

2. Which dimensions of global citizenship are integrated into student learning outcomes given in the Social Studies National curriculum?

3. In what ways do Social Studies textbooks provide instructional strategies and activities for teachers regarding the global citizenship concept?

4. How are dimensions of global citizenship integrated into the assessment and evaluation exercises of Social Studies textbooks?

Methodology

The design of this research study was content analysis within the qualitative paradigm. The type of content analysis was relational analysis because the content was analyzed in the context of a predetermined concept (Wilson, 2016), under the scope of eight Global Citizenship dimensions which were adopted from the global citizenship framework of UNICEF (2013). This research study was based on the deductive approach because it aimed to analyze the integrated extent of a developed concept in a new context (Kyngas & Kaakinen, 2020), which is the extent of the global citizenship concept in the Social Studies curriculum and textbooks for Grade IV-V. The data source for this research study was secondary as the researcher reviewed the Social Studies curriculum and textbooks for Grades IV-V which were developed for the Province of Sindh, Pakistan. Social Studies subject to be reviewed has been chosen as it inculcates the sense of interaction among people as well as with the environment, which is an element of global citizenship education (Ay & Tokcan, 2019).

Data collection for this research study was done with the help of a checklist. This checklist was validated by expert opinion and pilot testing. Consequently, a checklist for data collection was developed with four components: Dimensions of global citizenship from the aforementioned framework by UNICEF, Student Learning outcomes, the teaching and learning process, and the assessment and evaluation process. After data collection, thematic analysis was done to emphasize the descriptions interpreted from collected data as well as to present the yielded themes from the research question. If any student learning outcome, instructional

strategy, lesson activity, exercise item for assessment and evaluation reflected fell in the scope of the eight global citizenship dimensions, it was recorded in the checklist along with the evidence in that particular dimension. The exact student learning outcome number, instructional strategy and activity page number, and assessment and evaluation exercise item number were recorded as the evidence. It can also be seen in the consolidated tables presented in the section on results and findings.

Findings

The following section presents the results and findings of the research study achieved through thematic analysis under the paradigm of qualitative design. Findings have been consolidated in some tables as well for a clear picture along with its description classified under three different themes.

Thematic Analysis

SLOs, Teaching and Learning Process, and Assessment and Evaluation Process in Social Studies Curriculum and Textbook

1) Findings on Grade IV. Findings on examining unit-wise student learning outcomes, teaching and learning process along with assessment and evaluation process given in Social Studies textbook and curriculum document for Grade IV have been presented in Table 1.

Table 1

Examination of Student Learning Outcomes, Teaching-Learning Process, Assessment, and Evaluation Process for the concept of Global Citizenship: Grade IV

Chapter	SLOs	Teaching and Learning Process	Measurement-Assessment and Evaluation items
Globe and map skills Historical events of the Province	World Geography (1, 4, 5, 6, 9, 13, 14, 15, 16) Awareness of diverse perspectives (9, 11) Economic and political processes (6) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (10) World Geography (8)	World Geography (pages 2, 4, 9) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (pages 17, 19) World Geography (page 17)	World Geography (A1, A6, A8) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (B2, B3)

Interaction between our land and its people	Environment and sustainable development (11, 12, 13, 15) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (4, 5) World Geography (9, 10)	World Geography (page 39, 41)	Environment and sustainable development (D2, E1, E2) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (B3, B4, B5)
Weather	Environment and sustainable development (7) World Geography (5, 8)	_____	Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (D1) World Geography (B3, B4)
The way we live together	Awareness of diverse perspectives (2) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6) World Geography (3, 5)	Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (page 67)	Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (B1, B2, B3, C1, D) World Geography (E)
Government: The way we govern ourselves	Economic and political processes (1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 13, 14, 15) Globalization and interdependence (16) Human rights (1, 10, 12, 14) Peace and conflict (7)	Economic and political processes (pages 84, 85, 86) Globalization and interdependence (page 87) Human rights (page 88)	Economic and political processes (A1, A2, B2, B3, B4, C1, D1) Globalization and interdependence (B8) Human rights (A3, A4, A5, B5, B6, B7)
Means of Communication	Globalization and interdependence (4)	Globalization and interdependence (page 94)	Globalization and interdependence (B1, B2)
Getting along with others	Awareness of diverse perspectives (2, 3) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (2) Peace and conflict (1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8)	Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (page 100) Peace and conflict (page 101, 105)	Peace and conflict (A1, A2, A3, A4, A5, B1, B2 B3, B4, B5, D1, E1, E2)
Goods and Services	Economic and political processes (1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6)	Economic and political processes (pages 111, 113, 114, 116)	Economic and political processes (A1, A2, A3, A4, A5, B1, B2, B3, B4, C1, D1, D2, E)
Our Heroes and Heroines	Awareness of diverse perspectives (4, 5) Economic and political processes (2) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (6) Human rights (1)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (page 132) Human rights (page 134, 139)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (C2, C3, C4, D, E) Human rights (A, B)

Student Learning Outcomes Almost all the dimensions of global citizenship provided by UNICEF (2013) in the global citizenship framework have been covered though the extent to which these are included, varies in the content. In the first chapter, 'Globe and map skills', only the dimension 'World Geography' has been covered because the 6th student learning outcome is 'locate and name the continents and oceans on the globe and world map.' Thus students learn about other continents and countries of the world.

Similarly, integration of the dimension 'Awareness of diverse perspective' can be seen in four different chapters reflected through student learning outcomes. An example that can be cited in the 11th student learning outcome of the chapter 'Historical events of the Province' is 'construct personal historical narratives, providing an opportunity to students so they share their perspective concerning their knowledge, exposure, and experience.

On the contrary, there are only two pieces of evidence of the dimension 'Globalization and interdependence' found under the scope of student learning outcomes. Moreover, the dimension of 'Economic and political processes' has been integrated to a great extent. One evidence can be found in the 3rd student's learning outcome of the chapter 'Goods and Services, which is 'explain cause and effect resulting from economic decisions.' Furthermore, the dimension 'Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding have also been integrated to a great extent into the curriculum of Social Studies for Grade IV.

Equally important, Knowledge of 'Environment and sustainable development is reflected in the student learning outcomes to some extent. One such piece of evidence can be found in one of the student learning outcomes of the chapter 'Interaction between our land and its people as 'identify how environmental changes affect people.' Another dimension, 'Human rights' has been integrated into the curriculum of Social Studies for Grade IV to some extent. It could be observed while examining the student learning outcomes in chapter 'Government: The way we govern ourselves.' The 14th SLO of this chapter is 'list important rights and responsibilities of citizens.'

Another important and interesting dimension of global citizenship is 'Peace and conflict.' This is an important skill for students to learn which will help them

in daily life. 'Getting along with others is a chapter that inculcates the concept of peace through resolving conflicts.

Teaching and Learning Process The teaching and learning process has been examined using the textbook of Social Studies for Grade IV. It includes instructional strategies as well as activities to be done during the lesson. As it can be seen in Table 1, the extent of global citizenship concept integration, based on the dimensions designed, is low in this process as compared to student learning outcomes. The chapter 'Weather' does not have any instructional strategy as well as activity based on the dimensions of global citizenship. There was evidence of anyone global citizenship dimension in some chapters' Teaching and Learning process: namely 'World Geography' is the only dimension evident in the chapter 'Globe and map skills' and 'Interaction between our land and its people'; the dimension 'Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding' is evident in the chapter 'The way we live together. Likewise, the only dimension evident in the teaching and learning process of the chapter 'Means of Communication' is 'Globalization and interdependence' and the only dimension of global citizenship evident in the teaching and learning process of the chapter 'Good and Services' is 'Economic and political process.' 'Environment and sustainable development are not evident anywhere in the teaching and learning process of Social Studies for Grade IV.

The rest of the chapters have at least two or three dimensions of global citizenship. Evidence of 'World Geography' can be found in the instructions of the chapter 'Historical events of the Province' on page 17 of the textbook, 'Help students find out where Iran and Iraq are located on the map of Asia. Encourage them to use map skills from chapter 1 when looking for these countries on the map.' Another evidence of the dimension 'Awareness of diverse perspective' can be found in one of the classroom activities designed for the chapter 'Our Heroes and Heroines'. Similarly, another interesting classroom activity for the knowledge of 'Peace and conflict' can be seen in the chapter 'Getting along with others' on page 101 of the textbook, which is 'For each cause of the conflict: resources, power, and values, give one example of conflict.' Unfortunately, there are fewer instructional strategies and classroom activities provided in the textbook irrespective of the concept of global citizenship.

Assessment and Evaluation Process Assessment and Evaluation Exercises given at the end of each chapter of the Social Studies textbook for Grade IV were also examined. It can be seen in Table 1. All the dimensions of global citizenship are evident in the assessment and evaluation items to some extent.

Assessment items developed on the knowledge of 'Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding is evident in many chapters including 'Historical events of the Province' in the assessment item B2, 'Compare the life in a village to the life in a city. Another evidence of the dimension 'World Geography' and 'Globalization and interdependence' in the chapter 'The way we live together in the evaluation exercise E as 'Find another country in Asia. Collect information on the fruits produced there and exported to other countries. Similarly, the Dimension of 'Economic and political processes' is evident in the assessment section of the chapter 'Government: The way we govern ourselves' which is item B2 'What are the branches of government and their tasks?' Other dimensions of global citizenship like 'Environment and sustainable development, 'Human rights, 'Peace and conflict', and 'Awareness of diverse perspectives have also been integrated to some extent in the assessment and evaluation process of Social Studies for Grade IV.

2) Findings on Grade V. Findings on examining student learning outcomes, teaching and learning process along with assessment and evaluation process in Social Studies curriculum and textbook for Grade V regarding selected dimensions of global citizenship have been presented chapter-wise in Table 2.

Table 2

Examination of Student Learning Outcomes, Teaching-Learning Process, Assessment, and Evaluation Process for the Concept of Global Citizenship: Grade V

Chapter	SLOs	Teaching and Learning Process	Measurement-Assessment and Evaluation items
Globe and Map skills Physical Regions	World Geography (1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 11) Globalization and interdependence (7, 8, 10) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (5) World Geography (4, 5, 6)	World Geography (page 7) Globalization and interdependence (page 29) World Geography (page 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 31)	World Geography (A1, A2, A3, A4, A5, B1, B2, C) Globalization and interdependence (B2, B3, C) World Geography (A3, A5, B3, D2, E)
Climate	Environment and sustainable development (11, 12, 13) Globalization and interdependence (11, 12, 13) World Geography (2, 4, 5, 6, 8)	World Geography (page 34)	Environment and sustainable development (B6, E2) Globalization and interdependence (B3, E2) World Geography (A1, A2, B3, C, D2, D4)
Why do we learn History?	Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (3)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (page 47) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (page 49)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (B3, B6, C, D, E) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (B1)
The struggle for Independence	Awareness of diverse perspectives (3) Globalization and interdependence (2) Economic and political processes (5, 6)	Economic and political processes (pages 54, 56, 62) Peace and conflict (pages 56, 58, 62) World Geography (page 56)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (D1) Economic and political processes (A1, A2, A3, A5, B8) Human rights (B4) Peace and conflict (B3, B7)
Important people and events in the history of Pakistan and the World	Awareness of diverse perspectives (5) Economic and political processes (10, 11) World Geography (3)	World Geography (page	Awareness of diverse perspectives (D2) Economic and political processes (B6A) Peace and conflict (A5, D6) World Geography (A4, D5)

Culture	Awareness of diverse perspectives (8) Globalization and interdependence (5) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (1, 2, 3, 4, 7)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (page 79, 89) Globalization and interdependence (page 83, 89) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (pages 79, 80)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (A2, B2, B3, B5, C, D1, E) Globalization and interdependence (A3) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (A1, A4, B2, B4) World Geography (A4, A5)
Goods and Services	Economic and political processes (1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 9)	Economic and political processes (pages 94, 95, 97, 99)	Economic and political processes (A1, A3, A4, B1, B2, B3, B4, B5, B6, B7)
Money in our lives	Economic and political processes (1, 2, 3, 5) Globalization and interdependence (2)	Economic and political processes (page 104, 105) Globalization and interdependence (page 105)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (E) Economic and political processes (A1, A3, A4, A5, B1, B2, B3,) Globalization and interdependence (A2, B2, C) World Geography (C)
Means of information	Awareness of diverse perspectives (3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 11, 12)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (pages 109, 110, 111, 112, 114)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (B2, B5, B6, D1, D5)
Our values, our behavior	Awareness of diverse perspectives (3, 4, 5, 6) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (1, 2)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (pages 116, 118)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (A2, A3, A4, B, D) Environment and sustainable development (C) Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding (A1)
The system of the Government of Pakistan	Economic and political processes (1, 4, 8, 10, 15) Human rights (8, 9) Peace and conflict (13)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (page 129) Economic and political processes (page 123, 125) Human rights (page 128, 129)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (D3) Economic and political processes (A1, A5, B1, B4, B11) Human rights (B11, B12)
Explorers and Explorations	Awareness of diverse perspectives (1, 7, 8) World Geography (4)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (page 143) World Geography (pages 136, 137, 139)	Awareness of diverse perspectives (B3, B4, D2, E) World Geography (A1, A2, A4, A5, B3, D1)

Student Learning Outcomes After data analysis, it can be interpreted that the extent to which dimensions of the global citizenship concept are incorporated, varies throughout different learning content evident via all eight dimensions of global citizenship. The dimension 'World Geography' is reflected in many student learning outcomes in different chapters. One of the pieces of evidence is the 7th student learning outcome in the chapter 'Globe and map skills', namely, 'identify time zones and relate them to longitudes.'

The concept of 'Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding' has also been integrated into the student learning outcomes in Social Studies curriculum for Grade V. One such example can be noticed in the chapter 'Culture', wherein the 3rd learning outcome is to 'describe cultural diversity. Similarly, the concept of 'Globalization and interdependence' can be found in many chapters including 'Money in our lives. Its 2nd learning outcome is, 'understand different countries have different currencies and they are interdependent'. 'Awareness of diverse perspectives as an important dimension of global citizenship has also been integrated into the curriculum of Social Studies for Grade V. One such evidence is the 5th learning outcome of the chapter 'Important people and events in the history of Pakistan and the world'. Equally important, is the fact that all the dimensions of global citizenship have been covered in the student learning outcomes, though the extent differs.

Teaching and Learning Process The teaching and learning process given in the Social Studies textbook for Grade V includes instructional strategies as well as activities to be done during the lesson. It is obvious in Table 2 that the extent of global citizenship concept integration is less in the teaching and learning process

All the seven dimensions of global citizenship have been integrated into the instructional strategies and activities for each chapter other than 'Environment and political processes". There is no evidence of the aforementioned dimension in the teaching and learning activities. In other chapters, one such segment occurs on page 56, where it says, 'On a map of the world, locate the countries that fought in World War I. Color the countries that were part of the Central powers red, and color the countries that formed the Allies blue.'

Similarly, activity on page 29 of the textbook from chapter 'Physical regions'

is a depiction of integration of 'Globalization and interdependence', namely, 'list different ways in which people are interdependent.' This activity highlights the importance of understanding how we are all interdependent despite living in any part of the world. Furthermore, 'Awareness of diverse perspectives is evident in the chapter 'our values, our behavior'. One such activity is given on page 116 of the textbook as 'list three values you think all the members of your family share. Also, list three values that you and your friends have in common.' Additionally, the integration of 'Economic and political processes in the teaching and learning process can be seen in different chapters. Moreover, the activity on page 104, 'make a timeline to show how money has evolved' of chapter 'Money in our lives is the evidence of 'Economic and political processes'.

Assessment and Evaluation Process Each assessment and evaluation exercise item for all chapters was examined concerning global citizenship. It can also be seen in Table 2. that all eight dimensions of global citizenship have been integrated into the assessment and evaluation exercises. However, the predominant dimension in this process is 'Awareness of diverse perspectives.' For example, it is evident in the exercise item B3 of the chapter 'Explorers and explorations,' 'what do you think will be the areas of exploration in the future and what changes do you think would result from these explorations?' It allows students to share their viewpoints and learn to accept others'.

Similarly, 'Economic and political processes have been integrated into the assessment and evaluations section of the chapter 'The system of Government of Pakistan'. Exercise item B1 'What is a constitution? Why is a constitution important for a country?' is an example of the political knowledge one must possess. While reviewing the same chapter, the dimension of 'Human rights' was evident in the exercise item B12, i.e. 'What are Human Rights? How do they differ from your legal rights as a citizen?' Another dimension, 'Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding' is evident in the assessment and evaluation process of many chapters. One such piece of evidence can be presented from the chapter 'Our values, our behavior', that is exercise item A1: 'Identify the factors from other cultures that influence our values. Give examples to show how family and education influence our values.' All eight dimensions of the global citizenship concept have been integrated into the assessment and evaluation process of Social Studies for Grade V.

Discussion

This research study aimed to investigate the extent of the global citizenship concept in the Social Studies curriculum and textbooks for Grades IV and V by examining the nature of student learning outcomes. It was evident that student learning outcomes of Grade IV focused 'Economic and Political processes' more as compared to others. According to Sant et al. (2018), students should study economics and politics so they may understand how law, rules and regulations, trade, culture, customs, and history affect the economy of one state.

As well as knowledge of 'World Geography' has been emphasized. Students learn different facts about the world, including continents, countries, cities, oceans, deserts, rivers, etc. (Golightly, 2020). Whereas, after examining the nature of student learning outcomes developed for Grade V, it equally emphasized the knowledge of World Geography as well as Economic and political processes, then understanding and acceptance of diverse perspectives. If we compare the content of both Grade IV and V, then 'Economic and political processes' as a dimension has been integrated to a vast extent.

Another objective of this research study was to examine the teaching and learning process designed for Grades IV and V. It could be seen that once again knowledge and understanding of 'Economic and political processes' were predominant in the teaching and learning process of Grade IV. However, the knowledge of 'World Geography', 'Awareness of diverse perspectives, and 'Economic and political processes' was predominant in the teaching and learning process of Grade V. Similarly, according to Torres and Bosio (2020), students as global citizens should accept others' opinions which are only possible through self-awareness and broad knowledge. As a result, they can see the world through others' eyes as well.

The last objective of the research study was to examine the assessment and evaluation process. It was evident that knowledge and understanding of 'Economic and political processes' had been emphasized in the assessment and evaluation exercises for Grade IV students. Moreover, understanding and knowledge of 'Peace and conflict' and 'Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding' were the predominant dimensions as well. On the other hand, understanding of 'World Geography' and 'Awareness of diverse perspectives are equally predominant and evident in the assessment and evaluation exercises of Grade V. Importance of

'Peace and Conflict' knowledge cannot be ignored as it helps individuals understand that nature of conflict, why it occurs, what are its consequences, and how to form peace for a desirable human condition (Ollila, & Macy (2019). Equally important, 'Human diversity and cross-cultural understanding' empowers individuals to examine different societies and cultures, as well as to identify the similarities and differences between them (Tiessenm et al., 2018).

Syaifullah et al. (2020) comment that education is not merely a method for globalization or reconciliation, but it is an additional device for conquering the issues made by globalization. That is the reason it is of extraordinary significance that the instruction/training framework must recharge itself in this sense and add to this procedure. In this unique situation, global citizenship education through training has picked up significance in instruction/educational frameworks around the globe. Obiakor, (2021) claims that educating students for global citizenship inculcates the possibility of having a place in their country, as well as in the world, and incorporates worldwide issues, such as democracy, human rights, and social equity.

In today's era, Global Citizenship Education develops mankind for innovation as far as empowers people and proclaims a perspective of the world as a united framework brought together where the general needs of the planet are considered as the main priority (Higgs, 2018). Therefore, GCE can be seen as a way to support shared qualities and equip nationals with abilities for participatory citizenship. A typical idea in the GCE writing is that training towards global citizenship should comprise of (a) learning of existing worldwide patterns and shared general qualities (harmony, democracy, human rights, resilience, equity), (b) advancement of abilities expected to practice ones' city and political rights effectively and (c) disguise of humanistic qualities and dispositions (McKay & Michael, 2021).

Conclusion and Recommendations

This research study was an attempt to investigate the Social Studies curriculum and textbooks for Grades IV-V about the concept of Global Citizenship to determine the extent of this concept in the Social Studies curriculum. Areas examined for relational content analysis were student learning outcomes, teaching and learning process, and assessment and evaluation. There are some recommendations for

the Social Studies curriculum and textbook developers for the Province of Sindh. The curriculum of Social Studies for Grades IV and V has not been changed or amended since 2007 despite addendums. Students learning outcomes, chapters and the content, lesson activities, instructions for teachers, and assessment evaluation exercises should be integrated with the concept of global citizenship as there is room for improvement. Furthermore, knowledge and understanding of 'Environment and political process', 'Globalization and interdependence', and 'Human rights' have been integrated to a very limited extent in the aforementioned components. Most importantly, integration of ICT with at least some lesson activities is crucial for the students in this dynamic global scenario.

References

Ay, E., & Tokcan, H. (2019). An investigation of prospective social studies teachers' cognitive structures regarding creative drama. *International Education Studies*, *12*(5), 56-67. https://doi.org/10.5539/ies.v12n5p56

Brugar, K. A., & Whitlock, A. M. (2020). Explicit and implicit social studies: Exploring the integration of social studies experiences in two elementary classrooms. *Canadian Social Studies*, *51*(1), 2-21. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1249464.pdf

Crawford, E. (2013). *Exploring our roles as global citizens: An educator's guide (grades 3-5).* http://teachunicef.org/sites/default/files/units/global_citizenship_gr_3-5_final_7-13.pdf

Crawford, C. E. (2018). *Citizenship education and global migration: Implications for theory, research, and teaching.* https://doi.org/10.1080/00071005.2018.1529953

Estellés, M., & Fischman, G. E. (2020). Who Needs Global Citizenship Education? A Review of the Literature on Teacher Education. *Journal of Teacher Education.* https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0022487120920254

Golightly, A. (2020). Self-and peer assessment of preservice geography teachers' contribution in problem-based learning activities in geography education. *International Research in Geographical and Environmental Education*, 1-16. https://doi.org/10.1080/10382046.2020.1744242

Higgs, P. (2018). Indigeneity and Global Citizenship Education: A Critical Epistemological Reflection. In *The Palgrave Handbook of Global Citizenship and Education* (pp. 209-223). Palgrave Macmillan, London. https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-59733-5_14

Jamil, M. G., Alam, N., Radclyffe-Thomas, N., Islam, M. A., Mollah, A. M., & Rasel, A. A. (2021). Real World Learning and the Internationalisation of Higher Education:

Approaches to Making Learning Real for Global Communities. In *Applied Pedagogies for Higher Education* (pp. 107-132). Palgrave Macmillan, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-46951-1_6

Kyngäs, H., & Kaakinen, P. (2020). Deductive Content Analysis. *The Application of Content Analysis in Nursing Science Research* (pp. 23-30). Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-30199-6

Lerch, J. C., & Buckner, E. (2018). From education for peace to education in conflict: Changes in UNESCO discourse, 1945–2015. *Globalisation, Societies and Education*, *16*(1), 27-48. https://doi.org/10.1080/14767724.2017.1387769

McKay, H., & Michael, S. (2021). Developmental Education Redesign in Colorado. *New Directions for Community Colleges*, *2021*(193), 57-69. https://doi.org/10.1002/cc.20439

Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan (2009). *National Education Policy*. http://itacec.org/document/2015/7/National_Education_Policy_2009.pdf

Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, Government of Pakistan (2017). *National Education Policy*. https://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/sites/default/files/ressources/pakistan_national_education_policy_2017-2025.pdf

Obiakor, F. E. (2021). Multicultural powers of "fluffy" words and actions in general and special education. *Multicultural Learning and Teaching*, *1*. https://doi.org/10.1515/mlt-2020-0006

Ollila, J., & Macy, M. (2019). Social studies curriculum integration in elementary classrooms: A case study on a Pennsylvania Rural School. *The Journal of Social Studies Research*, *43*(1), 33-45. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jssr.2018.02.001

Oxfam Development Education Programme. (2006). *Education for global citizenship: A guide for schools*. Oxfam GB. http://hdl.handle.net/10546/620105

Pais, A., & Costa, M. (2020). An ideology critique of global citizenship education. *Critical Studies in Education*, *61*(1), 1-16. https://doi.org/10.1080/17508487.2017.1318772

Pasha, A. (2015). Global citizenship in Pakistan. *International Journal of Development Education and Global Learning, 7*(1), 33-52. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1167831.pdf

Pashby, K., Da-Costa, M., Stein, S., & Andreotti, V. (2020). A meta-review of typologies of global citizenship education. *Comparative Education*, *56*(2), 144-164. https://doi.org/10.1080/03050068.2020.1723352

Pérez, A. V., Gámez, M. R., Briones, V. F. V., Viteri, C. G. V., & Molina, L. A. V. (2018). Sustainable development seen from environmental training in university

linkage. *International Journal of Life Sciences*, *2*(1), 12-20   https://doi.
org/10.29332/ijls.v2n1.75

Saddiqa, T., Anwar, M. N., & Khizar, A. (2020). Global Citizenship Education in Pakistan:
Awareness, Attitude and Challenges. Global Educational Studies Review, V(III),
315-326. https://doi.org/10.31703/gesr.2020(V-III).31

Sant, E., Davies, I., Pashby, K., & Shultz, L. (2018). *Global citizenship education: A
critical introduction to key concepts and debates*. Bloomsbury Publishing. https://
www.bloomsbury.com/uk/global-citizenship-education-a-critical-introduction-to-
key-concepts-and-debates-9781472592422/

Syaifullah, Affandi, I., & Somantri, M. N. (2020). Civic education, global issues, and
global citizen. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research,
418*. https://dx.doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200320.102

Tiessenm, T., Adler, P. S., Bennet, M. J., Jazeera, A., Anderson, L. E., & Beezer, A. (2018).
Global citizenship and study abroad: It's all about US Critical Literacy. *In Learning
and Volunteering Abroad for Development: Unpacking Host Organization and
Volunteer Rationales* (Vol. 18, No. 3, pp. 1-12). London: Routledge.

Torres, C. A., & Bosio, E. (2020). Global citizenship education at the crossroads: Globalization,
global commons, common good, and critical consciousness. *Prospects*, *48*(3), 99-
113. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11125-019-09458-w

United Nations. (2012). *Global Education First Initiative*. https://www.un.org/
millenniumgoals/pdf/The%20Global%20Education%20First%20Initiative.pdf

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. (2015). *Global
Citizenship Education: Topics and learning objectives*. Paris: UNESCO. https://
unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000232993

Van Werven, I. M., Coelen, R. J., Jansen, E. P., & Hofman, W. H. A. (2021). Global teaching
competencies in primary education. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and
International Education*, 1-18. https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2020.1869520

Wilson, V. (2016). Research methods: Content analysis. *Evidence Based Library and
Information Practice*, *11*(1 (S)), 41-43. https://doi.org/10.18438/B8CG9D