English Education Journal

The Effectiveness of Story Telling and Role Play in Teaching Speakingfor Students with High and Low Motivation

Adhe Risky Mayasari[1], Abdurrachman Faridi[2], Sri Wuli Fitriati[2]

[1.] MA Al-Hikmah Bandar Lampung, Indonesia
[2.] Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Article Info

Abstract

Storytelling and role play as techniques of teaching have been studied and believed to be effective for teaching speaking. In speaking class, students' interest and motivation are also improved as the impact of the techniques. The present research aims at explaining how significant the students' achievement is taught by using storytelling and role-play as techniques of teaching speaking to the students with high and low levels of motivation. The design of this research was a quasi-experimental design with a 2x2 factorial design. This research was conducted on eleventh-grade students at MA Al-Hikmah Bandar Lampung as the research participants. Then, the writer analyzed the result from the questionnaire and speaking test using t-test and ANOVA. The results of this research showed that the value of sig. of techniques and motivation was 0.00. It meant that sig. the value was lower than 0.05. It can be concluded that there was a significant difference in the students' achievement taught by storytelling technique and roleplay technique for students with high and low motivation. This research is expected to give a contribution to English teaching-learning such as giving appropriate techniques to teach speaking comprehension.

✉Correspondence Address:
Jalan Sultan Agung Gang Raden Saleh Raya No.23, Kedaton, Kec. Kedaton, Kota Bandar Lampung, Lampung 35141
E-mail:adheriskyms@gmail.com

INTRODUCTION

Speaking is one of the most important skills to be developed and increased as means that of effective communication. Nunan (2005)states that to most people, mastering speaking is the most essentials aspect of learning English as a second language, and success is measured in terms of the ability to carry out of the conversation in a language. According to Schunk (2012), the students need to have a good speaking ability to achieve the objectives of English teaching and learning as stated in the current curriculum. Learning involves effort, modifying knowledge, skills, strategies, beliefs, attitudes, and behaviors. People learn cognitive, linguistic, motoric, and social skills, and these can take many forms.

Based on the researcher's observation in MA Al-Hikmah Bandar Lampung in 2019, the eleventh-grade students have problems of teaching speaking English at school. First, most of the students cannot participate in speaking English to express their opinion because, in the daily teaching-learning process, the teachers were not concerned to teach how to use English in daily communication. Second, they said that they had difficulties in speaking because of their shyness and lack of speaking practice in class. Some said that they had no motivation to learn speaking because in the final examination they are not examined their speaking competence, only their reading and writing competence instead. Therefore, it makes them hard to learn English and become passive participants that just learn English on its surface not deeper than that condition affected to the students' score.

There are many techniques to make an interesting activity in teaching speaking. One of the suggested technique is storytelling. In line with Handayani (2013), storytelling can encourage students to explore their distinctive expressiveness and might heighten students ability to speak thoughts and feelings in an articulate, lucid manner. Besides, Akhyak and Indramawan (2013), states that using storytelling in teaching speaking could improve the students' fluency, grammar, pronunciation, vocabulary, and content. Another technique to help teachers in teaching speaking comprehension is role play. According to Brown (2004), role play is a popular pedagogical activity in communicative language teaching classes. In some version, role play permits some rehearsal time in order that students can map out what they are reaching to say. And it has the effect of lowering anxieties as students can, even for a few moments, take on the persona of someone other than themselves.

There were some previous studies exploring storytelling and role play in teaching speaking. Inayah (2015), Sulistianingsih, Patuan Raja (2016), Gufron and Zuhri (2018) discussed to increase on students speaking skill after the implementation of narrative storytelling technique, and to find out the aspect of speaking that increases the most after the implementation of narrative storytelling technique, and the result showed that storytelling which is applied in narrative speaking classroom is engaging for the students. Most of the students are enjoyable to learn speaking through storytelling technique. Thus, most of their ability to learn about narrative speaking through storytelling is good, the researcher finds that storytelling is an appropriate technique to teach narrative speaking to the students; moreover, the students

are interested in learning speaking through storytelling technique.

Besides, Mokhtar, Halim, and Kamarulzaman (2011) additional that the results of storytelling on students' language aspects of communication skills and to evaluate the extent to which storytelling helps in enhancing students' communication skills, and therefore result that storytelling has helpful effects on speaking skills by students being able to associate meanings and emotions with words. Students are also develop their vocabulary and learn where to use certain words and phrases.

Another technique to teach speaking comprehension was role play. Rashid and Qaisar (2017), they described the use of role play for developing speaking skills and examined it through experimental study. The students felt active to speak English because they were as in real situation. Then, supported by Krebt (2017) student can build on their opinions and thoughts and establish language on their level, acting out in some situations based on their understanding.

Based on the previous studies, the difference between the previous and the present study was that the researcher divided the students into high and low motivation. In this paper, the researcher aimed to find out the effectiveness of storytelling and role play techniques in teaching speaking comprehension for students with high and low motivation.

METHOD

This research used a quasi-experimental study with a 2X2 factorial design to investigate the relationship among variable. Based on the design, the independent variables referred to storytelling and role play techniques, while there was one dependent variable namely students'

speaking comprehension and the moderator variable of research was students' level of motivation in which consists of high and low motivation. Based on the research design chosen, this research had two groups experimental class. The first group experimental class taught by applying story telling technique and the second group experimental class taught by applying role play technique.

The population of this research was students of eleventh-grade of second semester students at MA Al-Hikmah Bandar Lampung in academic year of 2019/2020. The students were divided into three classes with a total 105 students. Storytelling was used in experimental group 1 (XI IPS) while role play was used in experimental group II (XI IPA). The instruments to collect the data were questionnaire and speaking comprehension test. Questionnaire was assigned to the students before all the steps of the experiment. The data of the questionnaire would be calculated to categorize the students based on their motivation level divided into two groups that consist of high and low motivation. The questionnaire adopted from Agus Lutfi (2018) and the items on the questionnaire asked respondents by using Likert scale that provide a range of responses to a given statement or question (Cohen et al., 2007).

The main instrument in this research was the speaking comprehension test. The aims were to know the students' speaking ability. The researcher used two kinds of test namely pre-test and post-test. The pre-test was conducted to know the students' prior knowledge before giving treatment in order to know the students speaking ability. Meanwhile, a post-test was used to know the students' improvement after they get the treatment. The result of pre-test and post-test

would be compared to find the significance difference students' achievement before and after giving treatment.

There were several steps used in this research to collect the data, the first step was doing pre-research that involved collecting information and distributing questionnaire. Collecting information was to collect some supported documents in teaching and learning process. Meanwhile, questionnaire was also to know students' motivation level. In this research, the validity of students' motivation questionnaire was calculated by using product moment correlation formula. Here, the score of each item and the total score was calculated to find out their correlation coefficient. The calculation was done by using SPSS 16 application. The researcher used ANOVA in comparing the achievement between 2 techniques and 2 moderator variables. Second, the researcher used a paired sample t-test to compare the result of pre-test and post-test. The last, the researcher used an independent t-test to compare one technique and two moderator variables.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

This section, the finding of the research and the interpretation of data analyzing the effectiveness of storytelling and role play techniques in teaching speaking comprehension to students with different motivation levels. There were 70 students from two classes in which one consisted of 35 students. There were 37 students with high motivation level and there were 33 students with low motivation level. In this research, the researcher wanted to know the

significance of both storytelling and role play techniques to students with high and low motivation. The researcher used ANOVA, one sample t-test, independent t-test and paired sample t-test. To measure the significant difference between the techniques and students' motivation, the statistics of ANOVA should be the level of significance less than 0.05. If the significance level is less than 0.05, it means there is significant difference but if the significance is more than 0.05, it means there is no significant difference between the techniques and students' motivation. SPSS application was used to conduct ANOVA test. The result of the measurement whether the hypothesis was accepted or rejected. It was based on the value of the significant of ANOVA test. The first comparison compared interaction among speaking techniques (storytelling and role play), students' motivation and students' speaking comprehension in teaching speaking. Normality, homogeneity, and hypotheses testing of pre-test and post-test were the requirements of the ANOVA, it has been completed descriptively and statistically. In the analyzing ANOVA factorial design, 2 x 2 calculated statistically by using SPSS analysis to measure the tests of the subject effect (multifactor analysis of variance). On first alternative hypothesis (H_1) was to discover the significant interaction between the techniques and students' motivation in affecting students' speaking comprehension.

To see the result of ANOVA, it the significant score is less than 0.05, it means H_1 was accepted but if the significance is more than 0.05, it means was there is no significance.

Table 1. The result table of ANOVA test of interaction between storytelling and role play techniques with high and low motivation of students in teaching speaking comprehension

	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Between groups	3186.487	1	3186.487	105.525	.000
Within groups	2053.356	68	30.196		
Total	5239.843	69			

Testing ANOVA has several phases to do, they were to test the alternative hypothesis (H1), level of significance (5%), F-count, F-table, and compare F-account with F-table. To compare the significant differences between F-account and F-table as follow: "The alternative hypotheses (H1) were accepted if F-account > F-table". The result (Table 1) above showed F-acc was 105.525 and F-table 3.98 (see F-table). It means that H1 was accepted.

To see the result of ANOVA, it the significant score is less than 0.05, it means H1 was accepted but if the significance is more than 0.05, it means was there is no significance.

In conclusion, there was significant difference in the interactions between storytelling and role play techniques with high and low motivation of students in teaching speaking comprehension.

The researcher would find out the effect of storytelling technique to students with high and low motivation using paired sample t-test. The results were explained in table 2 for students' level of high motivation and table 3 for students' level of low motivation.

Table 2. Paired samples test of storytelling technique with high level of motivation

(2 tailed)	Paired Differences						T	df	Sig.
Deviation	Mean	Std. Error Mean	Std. Interval of the Difference	95% Confidence					
				Lower	Upper				
Pre-test Post-test	-3.70588	3.60147	.87348	-5.55759	-1.85418		-4.243	16	.001

Table 3. Paired samples test of storytelling technique with low level of motivation

	Paired Differences					T	df	Sig. (2 tailed)
Deviation	Mean	Std. Error Mean	Std. Interval of the Difference	95% Confidence				
				Lower	Upper			
Pre-test Post-test	-6.55550	2.79121	.65789	-7.94359	-5.16752	-9.964	17	.000

The second result of the research, showed that the sig. value was 0.001, it was less than 0.05. It meant that H_1 was accepted and Ho was rejected. Based on the result of statistical calculation and a paired samples test as mentioned in advance, it could be concluded that story telling was effective for teaching speaking to students with high motivation.

The third result, the finding of the research based on the third question, it was to explain how effective storytelling technique to teach speaking comprehension to students with low motivation. Based on the finding, the value was 0.000. It was less than 0.05. Therefore, the data result demonstrated that the H_1 was accepted, the use of storytelling technique was effective for low students' motivation.

By applying storytelling technique based on the result of the second and third hyphotheses, the result showed that this technique was effective for teaching speaking comprehension for students with high and low motivation. Storytelling which was applied in speaking classroom was engaging for the students. Most of the students were enjoyable to learn speaking through storytelling technique. From those statement, this research was consistent with theory conducted by Mokhtar, Halim, and Kamarulzaman (2011), they argues that use of storytelling helps in enhancing students' communication skills.

The researcher would find out the effect of role play technique to students with high and low motivation using paired sample t-test. The result were explained in table 4 for students' level of high motivation and table 5 for students' level of low motivation.

Table 4. Paired samples test of role play technique with high level of motivation

	Paired Differences					T	df	Sig. (2 tailed)
Deviation	Mean	Std. Error Mean	Std.	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference				
				Lower	Upper			
Pre-test Post-test	-5.05000	4.80652	1.07477	-7.29952	-2.80048	-4.699	19	.000

Table 5. Paired samples test of role play technique with low level of motivation

	Paired Differences					T	df	Sig. (2 tailed)
	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference				
				Lower	Upper			
Pre-test Post-test	-5.86667	2.82500	.72943	-7.43113	-4.30220	-8.043	14	.000

The fourth result of the research, showed that the sig. value was 0.00, it was less than 0.05. It meant that H_1 was accepted and Ho was rejected. Based on the result of statistical calculation and a paired samples test as mentioned in advance, it could be concluded that role play was effective for teaching speaking to students with high motivation.

The fifth, the findings showed that the sig. value was 0.000. It was less than 0.05. It meant that H_1 was accepted and Ho was rejected. In other words, role play was effective for teaching speaking to the students with low motivation. In role play technique, the result showed that this technique was effective for both high and low students' motivation. In this case, there was any improvement in students' score. The students score were higher after treatment because role play made the students to active in speaking. The result was line with Khafidin (2013) states that the use of role play for developing speaking skill and examined it through experimental study. The students felt active to speak English because they were as in real situation. The class is also dynamic and life.

The researcher used an independent t-test to find significant achievement between high and low motivation taught by storytelling technique. The result was explained in table 6.

Table 6. Independent sample t-test between high and low motivation taught by storytelling technique
Levene's Test for t-test for Equality of Means

	Equality of Variances							95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
	F	Sig	T	Df	Sig. (2 tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	Lower	Upper
Equal variances assumed	.094	.761	9.183	33	.000	14.87908	1.6202	11.58265	18.17552
Equal variances not Assumed			9.174	32.712	.000	14.87908	1.62192	11.57815	18.18002

The sixth result showed that (H_I) was to prove whether there were significant differences in achievements between high and low students' motivation using story telling technique. The p-value of post-test (sig (2-tailed) = 0.000 and 0.000) were lower than the level of significance 0.05. It means that the H_I was accepted. It can be concluded, there were significant differences in achievement between high and low students' motivation using story telling technique. The mean for the high students' motivation is 84.65 and the low students' motivation is 68.33. It can be concluded that high student's motivation was slightly better than low students' motivation.

The achievement of the high motivation students got significantly higher after the treatment. From the explanation above, the researcher concludes that the story telling technique was a more slightly appropriate technique for high and low student's motivation levels. It means that there were significant difference in achievement between high and low students' motivation using story telling technique.

The researcher also used an independent t-test to find significant achievement between high and low motivation taught by role play technique in teaching speaking comprehension. The result of the independent t-test was explained in Table 7

Table 7. Independent sample t-test between high and low motivation taught by role play technique

Levene's Test fort-test for Equality of Means

	Equality of Variances						95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
	F	Sig	T	Df	Sig. (2 tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	Lower	Upper
Equal variances Assumed	1.126	.296	6.732	33	.000	13.48333	2.00287	9.40845	17.55821
Equal variances not assumed			7.033	32.997	.000	13.48333	1.91720	9.58274	17.38393

The seventh research questions explain how effective achievement between high and low motivation student taught by role play technique in teaching speaking comprehension. The result showed that the p-value of the post-test (sig (2-tailed) = 0.000) was lower than the level of significance of 0.05. It means that (H_I) was accepted. It can be concluded that there were significant differences in achievement between high and low student's motivation using role play technique The mean for high students' motivation is 82.70 and low students' motivation is 68.47. It can be inffered that high student's motivation was slightly better than low student's motivation.

CONCLUSION

Storytelling and role-play were effective in teaching speaking skills for students with high and low motivation. This technique is recommended for English teachers to be implemented in class for teaching speaking to improve their students' speaking competence, although the result can be different based on their level of motivation.

REFERENCES

Akhyak and Indramawan, A. (2013). Improving the students' English speaking competence through storytelling. STAI of Nganjuk, East Java, Indonesia. *International Journal of Language and Literature*, *1*(2),18-24.

Brown, D. (2004). Language assessment, principles and classroom practices. Longman.C. Richards, Jack and Theodore S. Rodgers. (1991). *Approaches and methods in language teaching.* Cambridge University Press.

Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. 2007. *Research Methods in Education (6th ed.).* London, New York: Routllege Falmer.

Fauzi, I., & Hanifah, D. (2018). Developing students' speaking ability through powerpoint presentation. *Loquen: English Studies Journal*, *11*(29).

Harmer, Jeremy. (2001). *The practice of English language teaching.*Cambridge: Longman.

Handayani, Heny. (2010). *Story Te lling Can Improve Speaking Ability for Beginner*. Unpublished Thesis. Bogor: University of IBN Khaldun.

Inayah, R. (2015). improving students' speaking skill through storytelling technique, *ELTIN Journal*, 2537.

Khafidin. (2013). Improving students' participation in speaking class through role play (the case at grade XI of state senior high school 1 Pemalang in the academic year of 2012/2013). *English Education Journal (Program Pascasarjana Universitas Negeri Semarang),3(*2), 94–100.

Kong Yuan. (2009). A brief discussion on motivation and ways to motivate students in English langauge learning. *International Education Studies,* 2,145-149.

Krebt, D. M. (2017). The Effectiveness of Role Play Techniques in Teaching Speaking for EFL College Students. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research, 8*(5), 863.

Lutfi Adib A. (2018). The effectiveness of simulation and role-play in teaching speaking for students with different levels of motivation. *English Journal*, *8*(4).

Mokhtar, N. H., Halim, M. F. A. and Kamarulzaman, S. Z. S. (2011). The Effectiveness of Storytelling in Enhancing Communicative Skill. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences,*18,163–169.

Nunan, D. (2005). Practical English Language Teaching: Speaking. Singapore: Mc Graw Hill.

Ozdemir, Osman. (2015). The effects of storytelling and role playing on young Learners' vocabulary learning and retention.*Inesjournal:*

The Journal of International Education Science, 530-548.

Rashid, S. and Qaisar, S. (2017). Role play: A productive teaching strategy to promote critical thinking. *Bulletin of education and research*, *39*(2), 197–213.

Samsudin and Sukrisno, A. (2016). Improving students' motivation in speaking ability by using story retelling. *EnglishEducation Journal*, *6*(2).

Schunk, Dale. H. (2012). *Learning Theories: An Educational Perspectives, 6th Edition*. New York: Pearson Education Inc.

Shen, L. and Suwanthep, J. (2011). E-learning constructive role plays for efl learners in china's tertiary education. *Online Submission*, 49.

Sulistianingsih, Patuan Raja, H. (2016). The implementation of narrative storytelling. *EEJ*, *3*(4),1-14.

Yang, Bowen et al. (2013). Learning English speaking throuh mobil based role plays: the exploration of a mobile English language learning app called engage. *EUROCAL, 1*(2).