English Education Journal

The Effectiveness of Herringbone and Buzz Group Techniques to Teach Reading Comprehension for Students with High and Low Reading Habits

Nunung Fitriyani✉, **Suwandi, Djoko Sutopo**

[1.] MA AL Lathifiyah Brati Grobogan, Indonesia
[2.] Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Article Info	Abstract
	This research which is based on the condition that the students often find difficulties in comprehending English text aims to investigate the effectiveness of Herringbone and Buzz Group techniques in teaching reading comprehension to students with high and low reading habits. An experimental research with 2x2 factorial designs was applied in this study. The samples of this research were the students of X Busana 1 and X Boga 1 of SMK Assa'idiyah 2 Kudus. Observation, questionnaires, and tests were the instruments of the research. In analyzing the data were used T-test and ANOVA. The results revealed that there was significant difference of the students' participation on the post-test result after being taught by using Herringbone and Buzz group techniques. Then, the result of the significance value (p value) of teaching technique and student reading habit was $0.00 < 0.05$. Thus, it can be stated that there is an effective interaction among teaching technique and students reading habits to enhance students' reading comprehension.

✉Correspondence Address:
Sobotuwo, Kronggen, Kec. Brati, Kabupaten Grobogan, Jawa Tengah 58153
E-mail: nunungfitriyani9@gmail.com

INTRODUCTION

Since English in Indonesia is a foreign language, most students at any levels of education get difficulty in reading English texts. Many research results (Syatriana, 1998; Hamra, 1993 and 1996; Mardiana, 1993; Kweldju, 2001) as cited in (Hamra & Syatriana, 2010) indicated that the ability of Indonesia Students to read English texts were very low. Based on pre observation, most of students in SMK Assa'idiyah 2 Kudus were still difficult in comprehending text well. The causes were reading habits, reading frequency, lack of vocabularies, inability in comprehending grammatical aspects, motivations in reading, and other reasons.

Reading is a part of English competence skills which implies both understanding and comprehending texts at the whole. According to Harvey (1990) as cited in (Suhana & Haryudin, 2017) argued that purpose of reading in language is to inform ourselves about something we are interested in, or challenge on certain matters. It is in lined withGodman, as quoted by Carrel et al (1995) as cited in (Rahila, 2016) reading is receptive language process. It is a psycholinguistic process in that stars with a linguistic surface representation encoded by a writer and ends with meaning that the reader constructs. In the other hands, there is an interaction between language and tough in reading. The writer puts thought as language in printed from and the reader analyses language to thought. From the process, the reader receives the message that the writer conveys.

Many efforts had been carried out by the Indonesian government to improve the quality of English teachers. The qualifications of English teachers were improved by facilitating them to go to university to get higher degrees, and through many other educational local activities all over the country. However, the result of the national examination for English subject was low; therefore, it still needs attention from the government and the English teachers. Using an interactive model of teaching reading comprehension is another effort to improve the reading comprehension of EFL students, especially the Indonesian students.

Nunan (2003), as cited in (Ulya & Faridi, 2017) stated that reading is a fluent process of readers combining information from a text and their own background knowledge to build meaning, and the goal of reading is comprehension.

According to Woolley (2011: 5), as cited in (Rosari&Mujiyanto, 2016) stated that reading comprehension is the process of making meaning from text. Furthermore, Pardo (2004) as cited in (Ayiz & Warsono, 2018) stated that reading comprehension is a process in which readers construct meaning by interacting with text through the combination of prior knowledge and previous experience, information in the text, and the stance the reader takes in relationship to the text.

The ironic problem which appears in teaching reading comprehension is students are difficult to formulate the main idea of paragraph. When students read English text, they just focus on translation. In fact, there are some text genres. Students can formulate the main idea based on the genre. The other thing that can affect the students' reading comprehension is student's background knowledge and it can be extended through reading habit.

According to Guillaume (2004) cited in (Yuliani & Barokah, 2017) reading habit is the ultimate way for students in taking the reading lessons or reading classes so that they will have the ability to comprehend what has been read to the means to get success in reading achievement. This implies that those students who have reading habit will have a lot of knowledge for their reading lesson. Therefore, the students will have a good chance to be successful in reading achievement by having a lot of knowledge they got from their reading habit.

Reading habit has some purposes whichare classified into four groups according to Ochanya, (2010) as cited in (Ayiz & Warsono, 2018) Reading habit can be particularly a hobby. A hobby is an activity that creates joy and satisfaction when we do it. The purpose of

reading habit as a hobby make a reader knowledgeable in so many areas, such as in educational, politic, religious and economic stuffs. Unlike other hobbies, reading habit is the most recommended hobby to shape readers personality skill. Reading as hobby is exciting for it helps the readers improve their ability to absorb and to comprehend written material and help pursue a better job in future.

There were some related studies which have been conducted previously. The first study deal with Reading comprehension Lahita et al, (2018) used Whole Brain Teaching and Reciprocal Teaching. They were effective applied in teaching reading comprehension to visual and auditory students. Hana &Faridi, (2015) used GIST and KWL strategies. The result of this study showed that GIST and KWL strategies are effective to improve reading achievement of male and female students. The second study deal with Herringbone technique. Putri&Isyam, (2013) teaching reading an analytical exposition text through herringbone technique to senior high school students. Yusuf et al, (2016) in their study focused on develop EFL students' reading comprehension taught by using Herringbone technique. The third study deal with Buzz group Ardayati & Nindiana, (2018) this purposed of this research was to find out whether or not it was effective using Buzz Group Technique (BGT) in teaching Reading. Nuriati et al, (2015) focused on whether or not the students' reading comprehension can be improved through buzz group technique. The last study deal with reading habit Suganda, (2016) the concern of this paper is finding the effective way of teaching reading to young learners in EFL context.

According to skeleton (Deegan, 2006; McKnight, 2010) as cited in Rosyida & Ghufron, (2018) Herringbone is a technique that used to find the main idea and important information (explicit and implicit) in the text by asking six comprehension question; Who?, What?, When?, Where?, Why? and How? in visual diagram of a fish skeleton. On the other hand, Buzz Group Technique is a technique that makes students work in small group in limited time. (Tarigan Eunike, 2012) as cited in (Pangaribuan & Manik, 2018) By using various techniques to improve reading comprehension means that reading is one of the difficult, interesting and important skills in English. That is why this study wants to improve reading comprehension.

Referring the topic and problems above, this research is worth to be conducted. The previous studies supported this research in terms of giving explanation about the benefits of techniques in teaching and learning language, reading technique affected students' reading comprehension achievement. In addition, they also showed that reading habits became one of factors influencing students' achievement in reading comprehension.

METHOD

This study used an experimental method with pre-test and post-test of a 2x2 factorial design. The object of the study was to improve reading comprehension by using two techniques compared. They were Herringbone and Buzz Group. The samples of this study were the students of X Busana 1 and Boga 1. Another class X Busana 2 was chosen for conducting tryout.

This research was basically conducted with five main activities, namely try out, questionnaire, pre-test, treatments, and post-test. Firstly, the researcher conducted try out to see the validity, the reliability, and the practically of the research instruments. Second, distributed the students' reading habit questionnaires to the first experimental group 1 which was X Busana 1 and to the second experimental group which was X Boga 2. After that, the pre-test was conducted to both experimental groups. The third activity was conducting treatments. The treatments for the first experimental group were implementing Herringbone technique to teach reading comprehension. The treatments for the second experimental group were implementing Buzz Group technique to teach reading comprehension. The last activity was conducting post-test.

After all the data obtained, the researcher analyzed the data. The researcher firstly calculated normality and homogeneity tests. One Sample Kolomogorov-Smirnov Test by SPSS 22 was used to analyze the normality of the pre-test and the post test. To test the homogeneity of the data, Lavene's for Homogeneity Variance was used. T test was used to test the result of teaching reading comprehension of recount texts by using Herringbone and Buzz Group techniques to students with high and low reading habits. While ANOVA test was used to check the relationship among variables.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In this research, the students were classified into students with high reading habit and students with low reading habit based on the results of students' reading habit questionnaire. Each of group had the same number of students. The result of students' reading habits showed that there were 15 students belonged to students with high reading habit and 15 students belonged to students with low reading habit in the first experimental group. In the second experimental group, there were 15 students with high reading habit and 15 students with low reading habit.

The pre-test was given to find out the students' reading comprehension before receiving treatments. It was in the form of multiple choices with 20 questions. The time allocation for the pre-test was 90 minutes.

The next stage was giving treatments to the first and the second experimental group. The treatments were given in 10 meetings to each experimental group. In every meeting of the treatments, the learning indicators, the teaching materials, and the teaching and learning activities were the same.However, the difference was the example of reading text. The first experimental group was taught by implementing Herringbone technique. The second experimental group was taught by implementing Buzz group technique. After receiving the treatments, post test was conducted at the next step. The post test was used to find out the result of students' reading comprehension achievement after receiving some treatments. It was also in the form of multiple choices consisted of 20 questions of reading comprehension. The time allocation for the post test was 90 minutes.

After all the data obtained, the researcher analysed the data. The data were called normally distributed if the level of significance α Kolmogorov-Smirnov and Shapiro-Wilk was > 0.05 in the pre-test and in the post test. The result of the data of Shapiro-Wilk in the pre-test of the first experimental group was 0. 224 for the students with high reading habit and 0.221 for the students with low reading habit at the level of significance α 0.05. Whereas, the data of Shapiro-Wilk in the pre-test from the second experimental group were 0.106 for the students with high reading habit and 0.100 for the students with low reading habit at the level of significance α 0.05. Since Sig. of both groups was more than the level significant 0.05, it could be concluded that the data in the pre-test of both experimental groups were normally distributed. The data of Shapiro-Wilk in the post test of the first experimental group were 0.07 for the students with high reading habit and 0.82 for the students with low reading habit at the level of significance α 0.05. Since Sig. was more than the level significant 0.05, it could be concluded that the data in the post test of the first experimental group was normally distributed. Whereas, the data of Shapiro-Wilk in the post test of the second experimental group were 0.061 for the students with high reading habit and 0.063 for the students with low reading habit at the level of significance α 0.05. Since Sig. was more than the level significant 0.05, it could be concluded that the data in the post test of the second experimental group was normally distributed. The normality of the data was analyzed as well as the homogeneity. After finishing the process of the pre-test data gathering, the normality should be checked in order to know if the data could be analyzed. Normality was counted to know that all scores are normal.

Then, the homogeneity is the important consideration before conducting the parametric

statistical analysis. Homogeneity test was conducted to find out whether the groups' were similar in their English reading achievement or not. Homogeneity was to know that both two classes are homogeneous. It was important because the similarity of both objects would influence the test result. If both classes are not homogenous, the treatment also cannot be conducted because both classes do not have similar ability in reading text achievement. The homogeneity is used to measure whether the result of the pre-test and post-test homogenous or not. The data of pre-test and post-test were analysed by using Lavene's for Homogenity Variance. The result of Levene Statistic of pre-test was 0.963 and Sig. was 0.461. Since the Sig. was 0.461> 0.05, it could be concluded that the data in the pre-test of the first experimental and the second experimental groups were homogeneous. The result of Levene Statistic of post-test was 0.224 and Sig. was 0.801. Since the Sig. was 0.801> 0.05, it could be concluded that the data in the post test of the first experimental and the second experimental groups were homogeneous.

To answering the research question this part to be discussed the hypotheses test. The explanations are as follows.

Teaching Reading Comprehension by Using Herringbone Technique to Students with High Reading Habit

The first aim of this study was to analyse high reading habit students' score of reading comprehension, in order to explain the effectiveness of Herringbone technique. The result showed that the mean score of post test result was better than the mean score of pre-test result. The mean score of the pre-test of the students' with high reading habit in the first experimental group was 59.00. It was improved into 81.67 in the mean score of the post test result. It was also supported by t count measurement. T count shows 12.048 with df 14. It means that $t0.05;14= 1.76$. Since T count= $12.048 > t0.05;14= 1.76$. So the firts null hypothesis of this research was rejected and Ha was accepted. Itcan be said that there was

significance difference in reading comprehension of students with high reading habit in the pre-test and in the post-test. On the other words herringbone technique was effective to enhance students' reading comprehension to students with high reading habit.

The results give a sign thatHerringbone technique (HT) is effective technique. It is in lined with Rosyida, F., & Ghufron, M. A. (2018). Students having high reading habit have better reading comprehension than those having low reading habit.

Teaching Reading Comprehension by Using Herringbone Technique to Students with Low Reading Habit

The second aim of this study was to analyse low reading habit students' score of reading comprehension, in order to explain the effectiveness of Herringbone technique. The result showed that the mean score of post test result was better than the mean score of pre-test result. The mean score of the pre-test of the students' with low reading habit in the first experimental group was 49.67. It was improved into 76.33 in the mean score of the post test result. It is also supported by t count measurement. T count shows 10.583 with df 14. It means that $t0.05;14= 1.76$. Since T count= $10.583> t0.05;14= 1.76$.

So the second null hypothesis of this research was rejected and Ha was accepted. It can be said that there was significance difference in reading comprehension of students with low reading habit in the pre-test and in the post-test. On the other words herringbone technique was effective to enhance students' reading comprehension to students with low reading habit.

Teaching Reading Comprehension by Using Buzz Group Technique to Students with High Reading Habit

The third aim of this study was to analyse high reading habit students' score of reading comprehension, in order to explain the effectiveness of Buzz group technique. The result showed that the mean score of post test

result was better than the mean score of pre-test result. The mean score of the pre-test of the students' with high reading habit in the first experimental group was 55.67. It was improved into 76.33 in the mean score of the post test result. It was also supported by t count measurement. T count shows 9.272 with df 14. It means that t0.05;14= 1.76. Since T count= 9.272 > t0.05;14= 1.76. So the third null hypothesis of this research was rejected and Ha was accepted. It can be said that there was significance difference in reading comprehension of students with low reading habit in the pre-test and in the post-test. On the other words buzz group technique was effective to enhance students' reading comprehension to students with high reading habit.

Teaching Reading Comprehension by Using Buzz Group Technique to Students with Low Reading Habit

The fourth aim of this study was to analyse low reading habit students' score of reading comprehension, in order to explain the effectiveness of Buzz group technique. The result showed that the mean score of post test result was better than the mean score of pre-test result. The mean score of the pre-test of the students' with high reading habit in the first experimental group was 48.67. It was improved into 72.33 in the mean score of the post test result. It was also supported by t count measurement. T count shows 7.532 with df 14. It means that t0.05;14= 1.76. Since T count = 7.532 > t0.05;14= 1.76, so the fourth null hypothesis of this research was rejected and Ha was accepted. It can be said that there was significance difference in reading comprehension of students with low reading habit in the pre-test and in the post-test. On the other words buzz group technique was effective to enhance students' reading comprehension to students with low reading habit.

Teaching Reading Comprehension by Using Herringbone and Buzz Groups Techniques to Students with High Reading Habit

The fifth aim of this study was to analyse high reading habit students' score of reading comprehension, in order to explain the effectiveness of Herringbone and Buzz group techniques. The result showed that the mean score of post-test of the students with high reading habit which was taught by Herringbone technique was 81.67. While, the mean score of post-test of the students with high reading habit which was taught by Buzz group was 76.67. The value of Sig (2-tailed) of equal variance assumed was 0.02 which was lower than the level of of significance (α) = 0.05. Therefore the null hypothesis (H0) was rejected and Ha was accepted. It proved that there was significant difference of using Herringbone and Buzz Group techniques to enhance reading comprehension for students with high reading habits.

Teaching Reading Comprehension by Using Herringbone and Buzz Groups Techniques to Students with Low Reading Habit

The sixth aim of this study was to analyse low reading habit students' score of reading comprehension, in order to explain the effectiveness of Herringbone and Buzz group techniques. The result showed that the mean score of post-test of the students with low reading habit which was taught by Herringbone technique was 76.33. While, the mean score of post-test of the students with low reading habit which was taught by Buzz group was 72.33. The value of Sig (2-tailed) of equal variance assumed was 0.01 which was lower than the level of of significance (α) = 0.05. Therefore, the null fifth hypothesis was accepted. It proved that there was significant difference on the effect of herringbone and Buzz group techniques to teach reading comprehension to students with low reading habit.

Interaction among Teaching Techniques and Students Reading Habits to Achieve the Effectiveness in Reading Comprehension

The seventh aim of this study was to explain the significant different of the interaction among technique, learning styles and reading comprehension of tenth grade students of SMK Assa'idiyah 2 Kudus was used to analyse the result. The result showed that the significance value (p value) of students' reading habits of both experimental groups that taught by using herringbone and buzz group was 0.00. It was lower than the level of significance (α) = 0.05. It meant that ha was accepted. It proved that there was significant difference between students with high and low reading habits on the result of post-test. It indicated that there was effective interaction among herringbone and buzz group, students' reading habits in teaching reading comprehension.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

This research focused on the comparison between the two techniques in teaching and learning reading comprehension; the use of herringbone and buzz group techniques. Those techniques were used to teach reading comprehension to students' learning style especially students with high and low reading habits. The objectives of the research were to answer the seventh formulated research questions. In the previous chapter, the data gathered from experimental class one and experiment class two were analyzed.

The first result indicated that was herringbone technique was effective and has significant different when it used to teach reading comprehension to the students with high reading habits in experiment class one. The second result proves that herringbone technique was effective to teach reading comprehension to students with low reading habit. The third result reveals the fact relates to the effectiveness of buzz group to teach reading comprehension to student with high reading habit. The fourth result proves that the use of buzz group technique to teach reading comprehension to students with low reading habit was effective.

The fifth result shows there was significant difference on the effectiveness of herringbone and buzz group techniques to teach reading comprehension to student with high reading habit. The sixth result explained that there was significance difference in effectiveness of herringbone and buzz group technique to teach reading comprehension to student with low reading habit. the last result revels that there was interaction among techniques, students' learning style and reading comprehension. The implementation of HT to overcome the students' problem in reading comprehension is successful. The students get benefit from modelling the use of this graphic organizer on a chart paper. In implementing the Herringbone technique, students are encouraged to organize and classify the information while they are reading. Herringbone Technique as one of graphic organizer used for establishing supporting details for a main idea is an effective tool to improve the students' comprehension.

From the score of the test, a calculation was made to find out whether the buzz group significantly affects students reading ability. In Buzz group allows everyone's ideas to be expressed. Students learn to work in real-life situations where others' opinions are considered. In Buzz Group sets the groundwork to get discussion starter expressing opinions, it is good for dealing with controversial subject.

The researcher found a number of limitations in this study. The first is the sample size. The researcher used small class and difficult to find significant relationships from the data, as statistical tests normally require a larger sample size. The second is the different levels of students' English proficiency and attitudes towards learning, the researcher use purposive sample to choose the sample of the research. Then, the researcher asked the English teacher to choose the sample of the research based on her perspective. Therefore it comprised of students with varies profiles. The last is the reasearcher didn't collect students' responses on the use of Herringbone and Buzz Group techniques in teaching reading in order to foster

teachers in formulating better lesson plans in using these techniques.

Based on the conclusion, the researcher would like to offer some ideas for those who are involved in English teaching learning process. First, teaching reading comprehension should be presented as interesting as possible. Herringbone and Buzz group techniques could be one of the options to be applied in teaching reading comprehension. Second, the English teachers should improve the way they taught the students with low reading habit by using herringbone and buzz group techniques. it was in order to minimize the significant different result toward those techniques.

The last, herringbone and buzz group techniques could be applied in teaching four language skills, reading, listening, speaking, and writing. It depends on teachers' creativity in extracting and designing the elements which will be used with the material.

REFERENCES

Ardayati & Nindiana. (2018). Buzz group technique (BGT) in teaching reading comprehension. *Journal of English Education Literature, and Linguistics*, *1*(2), 11–21.

Ayiz, A., & Warsono. (2018). The effectiveness of graphic organizers and gist strategies on students with different reading habits in reading comprehension. *English Education Journal Http://Journal.Unnes.Ac.Id/Sju/Index.Php /Eej The*, *8*(1), 10–17.

Hamra, A., & Syatriana, E. (2010). Developing a model of teaching reading comprehension for EFL students. *TEFLIN Journal*, *21*, 27–40.

Hana, A. M., & Faridi, A. (2015). The effectiveness of Gist (generating interactions between schemata and text) and KWL (know, want, and learned) strategies to improve reading achievement of male and female students. *English Education Journal*, *5*(2), 41–45. Retrieved from

http://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php /eej

Lahita et al. (2018). The effectiveness of whole brain teaching and reciprocal teaching in reading to visual and auditory students. *English Education Journal*, *8*(2), 186–194. Retrieved from http://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php /eej

Nuriati et al. (2015). Improving students' reading comprehension by using buzz group technique. *E-Journal of English Language Teaching Society (ELTS)*, *3*(2), 1–10.

Pangaribuan, T., & Manik, S. (2018). The effect of buzz group technique and clustering technique in teaching writing at the first class of SMA HKBP I Tarutung. *English Language Teaching*, *11*(1), 164–178. https://doi.org/http://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v11 n1p164

Putri, & Isyam. (2013). Student of english language teaching program of FBS UNP graduated on September 2013 advisor, lecturer in faculty of languages and arts, state university of Padang. *Journal of English Language Teaching*, *2*(September).

Rosari, L., & Mujiyanto, Y. (2016). The effectiveness of know-want-learned and collaborative strategic reading strategies to teach reading comprehension to students with positive and negative attitudes. *English Education Journal*, *6*(2), 33–41.

Rosyida, F., & Ghufron, M. A. (2018). Herringbone and tri focus steve snyder technique : the techniques for teaching reading comprehension viewed from students ' reading habit. *International Journal of Instruction*, *11*(3), 603–616. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.12973/iji.2 018.11341a

Suganda, L. A. (2016). Teaching reading for young learners in EFL context. *JELE Journal Of English Literacy Education*, *3*(1), 80–88.

Suhana, A., & Haryudin, A. (2017). The effects of reading habit towards students' reading

comprehension at private senior high school in Purwakarta. *ELTIN Journal*, *5*, 57–70.

Ulya, R., & Faridi, A. (2017). The effect of theme-based instruction compared to competence-based language teaching to teach reading comprehension to students with high and low interest. *English Education Journal*, *7*(1), 79–84. Retrieved from http://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/eej

Yuliani, S., & Barokah, F. (2017). The influence of online reading habit on reading achievement of the eleventh grade students of senior high school Muhammadiyah 1 of Palembang. *English Community Journal*, *1*, 51–59.

Yusuf et al. (2016). Developing the EFL students ' reading comprehension by employing herringbone Ttechnique. *Al-Ta Lim Journal*, *23*(3), 183–190. https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.155 48/jt.v23i3.250